SCIENCEDOMAIN *international*
www.sciencedomain.org

SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	**Asian Research Journal of Agriculture**
Manuscript Number:	**Ms_ARJA_43265**
Title of the Manuscript:	**GROWTH AND YIELD RESPONSES OF CABBAGE CULTIVARS AS INFLUENCED BY ORGANIC AND INORGANIC FERTILIZERS**
Type of the Article	**Original Research Article**

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty'**, provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.
To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline)

SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	**Author's comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Compulsory REVISION comments	It is clearly indicated in the Material and Methods section that the treatment structure used two factors and in the tables 1, 2, and 3 of the results the interaction effect of fertilizer management and variety are presented, however the statistical analysis (ANOVA) did indicate for the different growth parameters if the interaction of the two factors was significant or not, treatment means separation must be accordingly. **For the growth parameters, the most important is to find how these parameters affect the yields (agronomic and economic), and how are they correlated**.	
Minor REVISION comments	**Abstract** **Introduction** **Line 16:** "Cabbage is an important and nutritious winter leafy vegetable **in our country", which country?** **Line 19: "**The productivity of cabbage per unit area is quite low as compared to the developed countries of the world (Anon., 2006). **This is not in the references list.** *"Besides, the excess application of inorganic fertilizer causes hazard to public health and to the environment. But the application of both organic and inorganic fertilizer combined, can increase the yield as well as keeping the environment sound (Hsieh et al., 196). Considering the above factors, the present experiment was undertaken to compare the growth and yield of cabbage under organic & and inorganic fertilizer regimes".* **From this statement it is expected to have treatment with combination of organic and inorganic fertilizer regimes, this was not the case for this study!** **Materials and Methods** As in the abstract, the period of the experiment needs to be stated here. Explain if the environmental conditions of the production during the period of the experiment and how are they compared to the long-term conditions. Explain the management practices: dates of planting and harvest, when and how the fertilizers; organic and inorganic were applied. Fertilizers (4 levels): F0: Control, F1: 15 t/ha Cow dung; F2: 15 t/ha Poultry manure; and F3: Inorganic fertilizer- 300 kg/ha urea + 200 kg/ha TSP + 250 kg/ha MP then explain what TSP and MP stand for. *What are the nutrient content of the organic fertilizer (cow dung and poultry manure)?* The experimental design was a RCBD, but what was the treatments arrangements, are they set as a split plot and if so which factor was on the whole and which was on the sub-plots? Or as factorial arrangement? This will affect how the interaction of the two factors will be determined. **Data collection: explain how the growth parameters (plant height, root length, stem length, thickness of head etc.), were measured and what was the sample size or on how many plants per experimental unit.** The data obtained for different parameters and the mean values of all the characters were calculated and analysis of variance was performing by the 'F' (variance ratio) test. Plant height, at 15, 30, 45 DAT and 65 at harvest **Harvest: when, what was the harvested area for estimation of yield per ha?** **Results** Fig.3 and Fig.4 number of leaves/plant Fig. 4 **at different growth stages first, the different growth stages must be explained in the Materials and Methods section.** Presentation of ANOVA must present the interaction effect of the two factors before determine how the means of each measured factor will be presented. **Conclusion** It may be concluded from the result that V1F2 (Atlas – 70 × Poultry manure) performed best in producing higher yield than other treatments comprised with other variety and fertilizer application under the present study. On the other hand interactions of variety (Atlas – 70) and organic fertilizer (Poultry manure) showed its superiority in producing higher cabbage yield and economic production	

SDI Review Form 1.6

Optional/General comments	Cowdung@15 t/ha, F2: Poultry manure@15 t/ha and F3: Inorganic fertilzer- Urea@30 46 kg/ha, TSP@20 kg/ha, and MP@250 kg/ha. ***I think the use of @ for "at" is not appropriate in for a scientific journal*** It is important for the conclusion to indicate that the study was conducted only one year (how the climatic conditions of the study year are representative of the area?) and at a single site (how the soil of the site is representative of the area's soil?), so there with no repetition in time and space, the results must be confirmed before making a recommendation.	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	***Nouri Maman***
Department, University & Country	***Institut National de Recherche Agronomique du Niger (INRAN), Nigeria***