



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Soil Science and Plant Nutrition
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJSSPN_42090
Title of the Manuscript:	Influence of organic fertilizer (Nomau®) on soil, leaf nutrient content, growth and yield of Physic nut (Jatropha Curcas) in Makurdi, North Central, Nigeria.
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	1. The author should briefly put the importance of organic fertilizer application on physic nut in the Introduction section. 2. The author explained in the result as if there were significant effect of organic fertilizer on all soil variables. However, Table 3 shows the opposite. Please rewrite which one is correct. 3. The author did not make comparison between years which is also different especially the yield. The yield in 2010 is much higher than 2009.	1. This should come after the period on line 60. Physic nut crop undergoing various doses of organic fertilizer treatments exhibited increased yield, the maximum increase being recorded in plants undergoing organic fertilizer treatment where the seed yield was significantly higher than untreated plants Onwu <i>et al.</i>, [51] reported that application of higher doses of nitrogen resulted in higher seed yield of Jatropha plant. Patolia <i>et al.</i>, [52] recorded significantly higher yields in physic nut plants that received N and P (through urea, single super phosphate, farm yard manure and jatropha cake) over the controls. 2. This should replace line 63. Soil chemical proerties at the end of 2009 and 2010 cropping seasons showed increase in some elements in the treatments 3. Yield comparing may not be too necessary because it is a continuous experiment on a perennial plant that keeps increasing in so many growth parameters that lead to yield increase in each year.
Minor REVISION comments	1. Methodology in abstract should be written in logical order as the author has carried out in the field. 2. Abstract should contain background of the experiment at the beginning (1-2 sentences) 3. Units in Table 2 are unusual for manure. The units are usually for those of soil. Please convert to proper unit. 4. The author mention employed the mean comparison using DMRT, however,	1. it is in logical order as pre-planting soil sample was collected before planting. 2. From the General Guideline for Authors aim is the first thing. 3. Percentage (%) is their units. 4. Not on soil sample results.
Optional/General comments	Minor revision is a must. Please see attachment for revision	Comment [F1]: from the General Guideline for Authors aim is the first thing. Comment [F2]: that line is not to be moved because of the sequence of the experiment. Comment [F3]: The soil at the experimental site had soil pH (6.14) which was adequate for producing most crops in the tropics, low in organic matter (1.53 %), available phosphorus, cation exchange capacity, exchangeable calcium, potassium and Magnesium. Comment [F4]: all plots that received organic fertilizer had higher values than the control and pre-planting results. Comment [F5]: delete: if properly managed Comment [F6]: the proper word there is: inorganic Comment [F7]: the correct word is Obviously Comment [F8]: Vanlawe [11] stated that organic matter management remains a corner stone for successful farming in many areas of the tropical region in West Africa. Comment [F9]: This should come after the period on line 60. Physic nut crop undergoing various doses of organic fertilizer treatments exhibited increased yield, the maximum increase being recorded in plants undergoing organic fertilizer treatment where the seed yield was significantly higher than untreated plants Onwu <i>et al.</i>, [51] reported that application of higher doses of nitrogen resulted in higher seed yield of Jatropha plant. Patolia <i>et al.</i>, [52] recorded significantly higher yields in physic nut plants that received N and P (through urea, single super phosphate, farm yard manure and jatropha cake) over the controls.



SDI Review Form 1.6

		Comment [F10]: 98 meters Comment [F11]: Move to line 105 after period: Treatments were: 0.00, 0.50, 0.75 and 1.00 t ha⁻¹. Comment [F12]: it is a packaged organic fertilizer produced by the company called Nomau. Comment [F13]: percentage (%) is their units. Comment [F14]: from the results there were increases in values of the soil analysis compare to pre-planting and control. The values were not subjected to statistical analysis because it was a composite soil sample per treatment. Comment [F15]: Soil chemical analysis results at the end of 2009 and 2010 cropping seasons showed increase among all treatments. Comment [F16]: the weak acid release during decomposition also increase soil pH. Comment [F17]: yield comparing may not be too necessary because it is a continuous experiment on a perennial plant that keeps increasing in so many growth parameters that lead to yield increase in each year. Comment [F18]: delete: if properly managed.
--	--	---