

Line 21: Keywords should be other words that are not in title. They help with searching for the paper.

Line 66 – 69: “The factors were topsoil removal (0 cm, 5 cm, 10 cm, 15 cm and 20 cm); cropping systems (sole maize (SM), sole soybeans (SS) and maize/soybean intercrop (MSI)); and soil amendments (poultry manure, inorganic fertilizer and zero application.”

The title suggests that the study was done on maize only. What was the control in this study?

Line 81: Was the poultry manure analysed for nutritional quality, before application?

Line 107 - 109: Font size. How was irrigation scheduled as it has an effect on nutrient uptake? Removal of soil layers exposed different soil textures, which requires different irrigation schedules.

Line 112: “...and means were separated using LSD”. Which test was used to separate the treatment means.

Line 129: “...highest on the control plot...”. What was the control plot? No application of soil amendments with no top soil removal?

Line 151: If there was an interaction effect between topsoil removal and soil amendment on BD, then topsoil removal cannot be discussed independently as in line 135 – 140.

Line 154: “...4, 6 and 8 WAP...”. Fig. 1. Does not show WAP.

Line 211: “...intercrop (MSI) plots (1565 kg)...”. Is this yield for maize only or a combination of maize and soybean? If for maize only then there is no advantage since the soybean yield will increase the total yield.

Line 216 - 271: So the high organic matter content and total nitrogen in the control plots did not have any advantage.

Line 222: If there was an interaction effect on grain yield then the authors should discuss the interaction effect and not the individual treatments.