



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Research in Surgery
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJRS_40797
Title of the Manuscript:	Posterior inguinal wall reinforcement after mesh removal for infected mesh
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>highlight that paper is accepted based on his/her feedback</i>
Compulsory REVISION comments	<p>This paper is tried to describe a new repair technique following mesh removal in inguinal hernia patients. The authors should explain the mechanism behind the use of cremasteric apparatus in this field. What characteristics of the cremasteric apparatus provide a good support to the inguinal floor. What is the biological and biomechanical explanations?</p> <p>The paper did not search the literature about its own subject. There is data on this subject. Other authors previously mentioned inguinal hernia recurrence rates after mesh removal. No reference was given here.</p> <p>Inguinal hernia recurrence following mesh removal due to infection actually very low in previous papers. Even lower than that in the present paper. In light of previous data in the same field, could the authors of the present paper say that the use of cremasteric apparatus add any benefit over leaving the inguinal floor with no support?</p> <p>The statistical study in the table has no sense. The number of male and female patients does not require statistical comparison at all.</p>	
Minor REVISION comments		
Optional/General comments		

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Hakan Kulacoglu
Department, University & Country	Department of Surgery, Diskapi Yildirim Beyazit Teaching and Research Hospital, Turkey