



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Research in Agriculture and Forestry
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJRAF_44751
Title of the Manuscript:	Land use effect on surface runoff and soil loss: results of plot-based experiment along east-west gradient in subtropical China
Type of the Article	

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. In soil losses studies, especially conducting it in the rolling or sloping area, it must be consider the steepness of every area where this plots are established. Include this in your methods. 2. In the experimental sites, characterize the study area (density of every vegetative species, height of every species and the soil structure or the type of soil, etc.) which affects surface runoff and soil detachment. 3. Present your rainfall event during the study period. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) The topography of all land cover types is similar with a slope angle of about 20°(lines 80-81) 2) In the experiment sites and methods, we provide basic data that include the vegetation types, canopy densities, and vegetation specifications of the plots. Unfortunately, we do not have relevant data on soil types and will collect the necessary data in future studies. 3) In our method, we described the annual average precipitation in each sites(50-64).
Minor REVISION comments	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Do you conduct the study for a year, is it enough to have a conclusion? However, if you conducted for more than a year, you should presented or discussed your data gathered annually. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) The results of this experiment include two year of rainfall events. And your suggestion is what we're going to look at in the future.
Optional/General comments	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The collecting tank (1x1x1 m) in every plot is not enough to catch the annual rainfall in the east, central and west of China. 2. Discuss on how you will unload the collecting tank for another season of study. 3. In the runoff plots, what farming system you have done in your experimental plot during the study? Include this in your methodology. 4. What is the minimum rainfall event (duration and intensity) that may cause surface runoff in your study? 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) We recorded the data after each rainfall event, and then cleared the water and soil through the drain valve at the bottom of the trough. 2) We cleared the water and soil through the drain valve at the bottom of the trough. 3) Both weeding and fertilization are applied periodically. FL is annual crops including water melon (Fuyang site), peanut (Pingjiang site) and corn (Muchuan site).

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)	