# 2 CLIENTS' PERCEPTION AND SATISFACTION WITH NATIONAL HEALTH 3 INSURANCE SCHEME SERVICES: A STUDY OF ACADEMIC STAFF OF USMANU 4 DANFODIYO UNIVERSITY, SOKOTO

# 5 Abstract

1

- 6 Aim: To assess clients' perception and satisfaction with the National Health Insurance Scheme.
- 7 Study Design: This descriptive cross-sectional study conducted between October and
  8 December, 2017, focused on academic staff who were clients of NHIS at the Usmanu Danfodiyo
- 9 University, Sokoto, Sokoto state, Northwest, Nigeria.

10 Methodology 278 eligible academic staff completed a self-administered questionnaire, using

11 Simple random samplings

12 **Result**: Findings revealed that majority (99.3%) of the respondents were aware of the NHIS and

- 13 less than half (48.9%) enrolled into the scheme, with majority (59.6%) accessing their services
- 14 at University clinic. However about half (53%) of the respondents had poor knowledge of how
- 15 the scheme works, with 60.4% of them agreeing that NHIS has provided easy access to
- 16 healthcare while 79.1% agreed that it protects families from financial hardship of large medical

bills. Out of 278 study sample 136 academic lecturers (48.9%) enrolled into the scheme, and

- 18 67.6% were dissatisfied with the process of enrolment while 68.4% were satisfied with the
- 19 attitude of NHIS staff. With regards to the waiting time at NHIS clinic, 58.8% were dissatisfied,
- and majority 72.8% were not satisfied with the drugs received at the NHIS pharmacy. Finally,
- among the enrollees' majority 72.1% of the respondents rated the overall satisfaction as poor and
- 22 would not recommend the facility for family members/friends.
- Conclusions Based on the findings, it was concluded that the clients' overall satisfaction with service provision was poor. It is recommended that periodic survey of clients' satisfaction and
- 25 factors influencing it should be carried out by health Institutions and findings used as guide in
- 26 policy and decision making towards improving service deliver and client satisfaction.
- 27 Keywords:; Health; insurance; clients; perception; satisfaction;.
- 28

# 29 INTRODUCTION

- 30
- 31 Good health is essential to sustained economic and social development and poverty reduction.
- 32 Access to needed health services is crucial for maintaining and improving health. At the same
- time, people need to be protected from being pushed into poverty because of the cost of health
- 34 care (WHO 2018). Nigeria has shown commitment to achieving universal health coverage

35	(UHC), but report from WHO (2014) shows progress has been slow. A recent review of health-
36	system financing for UHC in Nigeria shows high out-of-pocket expenses for health care, a very
37	low budget for health at all levels of government, and poor health insurance penetration
38	(Awosusi 2014).
39	Less than 5% of Nigerians have health insurance coverage most enrollees are in the
40	formal sector with very poor coverage in the informal sector (WHO 2002). The recently signed
41	National Health Act is a viable framework, the implementation of which can fast-track progress
42	towards UHC (Uzochukwu 2015). This act sets the background to earmark adequate public
43	resources to health towards strengthening primary health care through the Basic Healthcare
44	Provision Fund. 50% of the fund will be managed by the National Health Insurance Scheme to
45	ensure access to a minimum package of health services for all Nigerians and 45% by the
46	National Primary Healthcare Development Agency for primary health-care facility upgrade and
47	maintenance, provision of essential drugs, and deployment of human resources to primary
48	health-care facilities. The Federal Ministry of Health will manage the remaining 5% for national
49	health emergency and response to epidemics.

In Africa, Algeria in 1949 adopted a statutory health insurance programme, followed by Libya in 1957, Tunisia in 1960 and Egypt in 1967. In 2003 the Government of Ghana established a National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIS) to make health care more affordable for the citizens (Mensa, Oppong & Bobi-Barima et al 2010). WHO has been involved in technical advisory work especially on assessing the feasibility of SHI in some African countries like Rwanda and Swaziland (Carrin et al, 2011). In Swaziland, because of the poor quality of care in the government sector, they adopted SHI as alternative options to the existing private medical aid scheme. The aim of their adopting SHI was to ensure universal access to health care by mobilizing additional resources to financing quality improvements, as well as build up tertiary, specialized care within Swaziland (Carrin et al 2011). Similarly Rwanda has spearheaded the development of a number of schemes that together

The rising cost of health care services, as well as the inability of the government health 62 facilities to cope with the people's demand necessitated the establishment of National Health 63 Insurance Scheme (NHIS, 2005). The history of the NHIS dates back to 1962 when the need for 64 health insurance in the provision of health care to Nigerians was first recognized (Akande and 65 66 Bello, 2002; Katibi and Akande, 2003). It was fully approved by the Federal Government in 1997, signed into law in 1999 and launched officially on the 6th June 2005. The Scheme is 67 designed to provide comprehensive health care delivery at affordable costs, covering employees 68 of the formal sector, self-employed, as well as rural communities, the poor and the vulnerable 69 groups. The NHIS in Nigeria seeks to provide health insurance, so that insured persons and their 70 dependents are able to have access to good quality and cost-effective healthcare services (NHIS, 71 2005). The formal sector programme of the NHIS specified that contributions made by or for an 72 insured person qualifies him or her, a spouse and four biological children under the age of 18 73 74 years to a defined health benefits package (NHIS, 2005).

There is a general consensus that perception involves the process of selecting, organizing and interpreting information about a person, product, service or a situation and coming to a subjective or an objective conclusion about the thing or situation. Ifezue, (1997) indicated that perception is the meaning an individual attaches to a given situation and this is based on accumulated past experiences of the individual involved. Perception originated from the Latin words "perceptio" or "percipio" which means receiving or acquiring of sensory information.

Perception is an active process responsible for organization of sensory information into simple,
meaningful patterns, (Ornsterin & Carstensen, 1991).

Perceptions made of events or entities depend on how we interpret what we see, what we 83 feel, what we smell and what sound we hear. One's perception of a thing or an event is 84 modulated by previous experiences. This is as a result of learning, attitudes and interests, as well 85 as current needs and the prevailing circumstance. Perception is also seen and described as the 86 consciousness of an object or an event. Berelson and Steiner (1964) saw perception as the 87 process involving selection, organization and interpretation of information inputs to make a 88 89 meaning out of the world. Our perception of an object or an event determines what our reactions will be. 90

#### 91 Theories of Perception

92 Perception as a theme has impressed so much on many scholars that a significant number of 93 theories have emanated over time. Some of these prominent theories are the ecological, and 94 constructivist.

I. Ecological theory of perception: Ecological theory of perception emphasizes that
perception is direct and that it functions like a radio interacting with definite stimuli
emanating from the object or event of interest (Gibson 1979, Shepard, 1984). The belief of
this theory is that the information for color-vision is present in the receptors. The theory
emphasizes that all information about attributes of objects or events are present or available
to the perceiver.

# 101 II. **Constructivist theory of perception:** The constructivist theory differs in that the 102 proponents believe that perception is not receptive and that rather it is a construction of 103 the mind which involves the perceiver's ability to make models of objects and events in 104 the world. Here the creation of an image of what could have accounted for this sensation

in the relevant organ must have been information inputs. But for completeness, these
 decomposed elements are once again assembled or composed into perceptions. They also
 attempt to develop a computational approach to visual perception.

**108** Literature Review

Study by Alnaif, (2006) on physician's perception of Health Insurance in Saudi Arabia 109 showed that health care service is a major concern for the respondents. Secondly, the respondents 110 believed that "everyone in the Kingdom should have access to health care services". They also 111 believed that SHI would improve access to health care, lead to more regulations and utilization, 112 create more competition for health care providers and more jobs in the health sector. Another 113 study on Perception and Demand for Mutual Health Insurance in the Kassena-Nanka District of 114 Northern Ghana by Akazili et al (2005), revealed the following findings: (1) existence of risk-115 sharing groups such as farmers groups, women groups and church groups whose members contribute 116 117 money for funerals and other general needs; (2) 93% of household heads had knowledge of the cash and carry system (3) forty-four percent of those interviewed were aware of governments plan to 118 119 replace the cash and carry system with a social health insurance scheme (4) About 93% of community members indicated interest in the scheme and were willing to contribute. On the contrary, 120 a few people believed that contributing money prior to the occurrence of sickness could attract such 121 illness and that forcing the sick to pay before receiving care, instead of receiving care before 122 payment, could constitute a major setback to the implementation of the scheme. 123

124

Perception of National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIS) by health care Consumers in Oyo State, (Awe and Sanusi, 2009), showed that (1) There is a relationship between socioeconomic indices and perception of the programme, (2) 87% of the respondents were aware of the programme, (3) About 72% of the respondents indicated that there was delay in attending to them for health care services and (4) 87% of respondents did not see any significant differencebetween the services provided under the cash and carry system and the NHIS.

Awareness and Perception of National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIS) among Radiographers in South East Nigeria, (Okaro, Ohagwu and Njoku, 2010). Shows: (1) there is a generally high level of awareness of the programme among the respondents; (2) seminars in hospitals are very important tools in sensitizing healthcare professionals, (3) participation in the scheme is low among the study population (4) there is paucity of knowledge of the operational principles of the scheme, (5) the study population was positively disposed towards the scheme.

137

A survey on perception of dentists in Lagos State by Adeniyi, (2010) reveals that 61% 138 had only a fair knowledge of the NHIS but 76.6% believed it would expand access to dental care 139 by improving affordability and availability of services. Another survey by Olugbenga (2010) on 140 the knowledge and attitude of civil servants in Osun State, Southwestern Nigeria, showed that 141 the NHIS documented that none had a good knowledge of the components of NHIS, 26.7% knew 142 143 about its objectives, and 30% knew about who ideally should benefit from the scheme. Study by Sanusi (2015), on assessment of awareness level of NHIS among health care consumers in Oyo 144 State, Nigeria revealed that 72% of respondents claimed that they were not promptly attended to 145 by their providers and hence wanted the program to discontinue. Another study which addressed 146 147 the issue of access constraints for government employees in Abakaliki, Ebonyi State, by Oyibo, ( 2011) found out that NHIS enrollees had little difficulty in accessing health care compared with 148 those relying on OOP payments. A study to assess the impact of the NHIS in promoting access to 149 healthcare by Ibiwoye, (2008) identifies the ineffectiveness of the scheme. Another study by 150 151 Osuchukwu et al, 2013 which evaluated the impact of NHIS on healthcare consumers in 152 Calabar metropolis, Southern Nigeria, documented that 54.0% respondents agreed that the quality of health care services rendered was better than before, while 38.5% respondents felt the 153 154 quality of health services was the same as before. Only 7.5% said that health services rendered is worse than before. A survey on users' satisfaction with services provided under NHIS in 155 156 Southwestern Nigeria by Osungbade et al (2014) showed that 60% of respondents encountered problems with their healthcare providers. These included long-queues, poor reception from 157

unfriendly health workers, inefficient treatment, and unclean environment. In another study by
Shafi'u, 2010, among staff of Ahmadu Bello University (ABU) Zaria to assess client's
satisfaction with the NHIS in Nigeria reports low Satisfaction which is attributed with longer
duration of enrollment.

162

# 163164 METHODOLOGY

165 Study Area

Sokoto is situated in the Northwestern part of Nigeria. The State was created from Old North-166 western in 1976; it assumed its present form after the creation of Kebbi State (in 1991) and 167 Zamfara State (in 1996) It is bounded by Zamfara State to the South, Kebbi state to the west, 168 Katsina State to the east and Niger Republic to the North. The State has 23 Local Governments 169 with Sokoto Metropolis being the capital, and the capital comprises of the Sokoto North, Sokoto 170 South and some part of Dange Shuni, Kware and Wamako Local Government Areas, The 171 metropolis is the seat of government and popularly called the seat of caliphate. It lies between 172 longitudes of 05. 11<sup>0</sup> to 13. 03<sup>0</sup> east, Latitude 13 00 North and covers area of 60, 33 square km. 173 The average projected population of the state for 2015 is 4,886.888 (UNFPA, 2015) with the 174 metropolitan having 425,969 (2006 census) Sokoto covers a total land area of 26,595,000m<sup>2</sup>. The 175 state has an average annual temperature of 28.3° C (82.9° F), it is one of the hottest cities in the 176 country. 177

Usmanu Danfodiyo University, Sokoto (formerly University of Sokoto) is one of the four Universities established by the Federal Government of Nigeria in September 1975, at which time three University Colleges (now full-fledged Universities) were established. The development of the university started on a temporary site (now called City Campus), situated along Sultan Abubakar Road, Sokoto Presently, there are thirteen faculties and a postgraduate school in the

183	University, The postgraduate school of the University was established in 1983 for the training of
184	graduates in various disciplines at the Masters and Doctorate degree levels. University
185	community have University Clinic for accessing Health care services and some people do visit
186	UDUTH and Specialist Hospital Sokto.

- 188 The following table gives the distribution of the various departments and units in the university
- as at the time of this study that is October to December 2017.

190

191

# 192 Distribution by faculties, departments and number of lecturers

FACULTY	DEPARTMENTS AND UNITS	LECTURER	
Agriculture	Animal sciences. Crop science. Fishery. Forestry	51	
Art and			
<b>Islamic Studies</b>	Modern European languages and linguistic.		
<b>Basic Medical</b>	Anatomy. Biochemistry. Chemical pathology. Microbiology.	78	
Sciences	Hematology. Physiology and Pharmacology.		
Clinical	Community Health. Medicine. Nursing sciences. Obstetrics	125	
Sciences	and gynecology. Paediatric. Psychiatric. Radiology.		
	Radiography. Surgery		
Education and	Adult Education and Extension services. Curriculum studies	71	
Extension	and Educational technology. Educational foundation. Science		
Service	and Vocational Education.		
Engineering	Civil engineering. Mechanical engineering and Electrical	24	
Law	Public law and Jurisprudence. Islamic law. Private and	26	
	business.		
Management	Accounting. Business Administration and Public Admin	47	
Sciences			
Medical	Chemical pathology. Hematology. Histopathology.	56	
Laboratory	Immunology. And Microbiology		
Sciences			

Pharmacy	Pharmacogenic and ethical medicine. Pharmacy and Toxicology. Pharmaceutics and Pharmacy microbiology. Pharmaceutics and medicine chemistry. Clinical pharmacy and Pharmacy practice	69
Science	Applied chemistry. Biochemistry. Biology. Pure chemistry. Microbiology. Geology. Physics. Mathematics. Computer science. Statistics.	175
Social Sciences	Economics. Geography. Political sciences and Sociology	74
Veterinary Medicine	Anatomy. Biochemistry. Medicine. Microbiology. Pathology. Parasitology. Pharmacology. Physiology. Public health. Theriogenology. Surgery and Radiology	50
TOTAL		976

# 196

197

#### 198 Study Design

199

A descriptive cross sectional study design was used for this study. This design has been used by several authors that carried out studies related to this study (Osungbade et al, 2014; Dalinjong et al 2012; Iliyasu, et al, 2010 & Onyedibe, et al 2012). Therefore, it is deemed appropriate for this study because it collected the data in a natural setting of the respondent, it entails systematic collection of relevant data and the statistical analysis of the data so as to present a clear description of respondents' perception and satisfaction of NHIS service delivery in Usmanu Danfodiyo University Sokoto

# 207 Study population

The population comprised of Academic Staff Union members of Usmanu Danfodiyo University Sokoto, Nigeria. All academic staff members of Usmanu Danfodiyo University Sokoto that are on ground during the study period October to December 2017 are inclusive in this study, while those that are on Study leave are not involve in this study meanwhile Non Academic Staff member were also excluded in this study

213

#### 214 Sampling Procedure

- (a) Sample size estimation and procedure
- 217 The minimum sample size was determined using the formula
- 218 n=  $Z^2$ pq / d<sup>2</sup> (Ibrahim, 2009) where:
- 219 n= Minimum sample size
- 220 z= Standard normal deviate at 95% confidence interval= 1.96
- 221 P = p = 65% (Proportion of enrollees who were satisfied with attitude of NHIS staff in a
- 222 study on users' satisfaction
- 223 q= q= 1-P(1-0.65) = 0.35
- d= Precision expected at 95% confidence limit (0.05) precision of tolerable alpha Error.
- 225 From  $n=Z^2pq/d^2$
- 226  $n = (1.96)^2 x (0.65) x (0.35) / (0.05)^2$  Therefore  $n = 349.5 \approx 350$
- Allowing for 10% non-respondent rate the optimum sample size will be n/RR (Ibrahim, 2009)
- 228 where n=350, RR=90% (0.9) this gives  $350/0.9 = 388.8 \approx 389$ .
- 229 Therefore since the total population is less than 10,000 the study applies following formula
- 230 Np= n / 1+ (n/N)
- 231 Where N = 976 (Number of Academic staff present during the study)
- 232 n= 389
- 389 / 1 + (389/976) = 278 is the total number of the study sample size.
- Therefore out of the 976 Academic staff lectures only 278 were enrolled in to the study
- 235
- 236
- 237
- 238



- the University are divided into faculties. A faculty is made up of a department and units where
- lecturers are operating from in a given department. As at the time of the study, there were 976

academic staff in 13 faculties in Usmanu Danfodiyo University Sokoto. A list of these faculties
was obtained from the University Data manager 2017, and all the faculties were selected.
Proportional allocation was used to select 278 respondents from the faculties, then simple
random sampling were done to select the respondent in each department.

246

247

#### 248 Data Collection Procedures

For this study, primary data came from academic staff lecturer of Usmanu Danfodiyo University 249 250 Sokoto (UDUS) who are present at the time of the study. Questionnaire was used as the means of collecting data. Thus, the study was structured, questionnaire administered to respondents as the 251 principal method of data collection. The questionnaire probed into the following: demographic 252 characteristics of respondents (age, sex, marital status, family size, and education), perception 253 and satisfaction of clients' towards NHIS services. Questionnaire was chosen as the suitable 254 instrument for data collection considering the fact that it is cost effective, ensures uniformity, 255 avoids ambiguity, avoids errors, saves time and has a relatively high degree of standardization 256

#### 257 Data Analysis

Data collected were analysed using SPSS software version 20.0. Categorical data were presented as cross tabulations and test of significance was by Chi square at 95% confidence interval. The analyses were carried out using variables such as the socio-demographic background (independent variables) and dependent variables that included enrollees' perception of the health insurance scheme, satisfaction with access and quality of care provided by the Health Care Providers (HCPs) and, suggestions for improving the scheme.

264

# 265 **Ethical consideration**

- 266
- 267 Ethical approval for the study was obtain from Usmanu Danfodiyo University Sokoto and
- 268 informed consent were obtained from participants
- 269 **RESULTS**
- 270 Socio-demographic Characteristics of Respondents

Variables	<mark>n (%)</mark>
Age (Years)	
20-29	12 (4.3)
<mark>30-39</mark>	84 (12.9)
<mark>40-49</mark>	104 (37.4)
<mark>50-59</mark>	<mark>36 (30.2)</mark>
<u>≥60</u>	42 (15.2)
Mean Age= $28.6, \pm 7.03$	
Sex	
Male	<mark>268 (96)</mark>
Female	10 (4)
Marital status	
Single	20 (7.1)
Married	<mark>256 (92.1)</mark>
Separated	2 (0.8)
Family size	
Less than 5	<u>80 (28.8)</u>
<u>5-10</u>	<u>88 (31.7)</u>
<u>11-20</u>	28 (10.1)
21 above	82 (29.4)
Highest qualification	
Degree	<u>40 (14)</u>
Masters	<u>108 (39)</u>
PhD	132 (47)

A total of 278 academic staff completed the self-administered questionnaire within three month
of this study. There were 268 males representing 96% of the respondents. And ages of
respondents ranged from 40 to 49 years, with mean age of 28.6 years and median of 29 years.
Majority 256 (92.1%) were married with 88(31.7%) had 5-10 children.. About half 136 (48.9%)

- of the respondents had been enrolled with the scheme and majority 81(59.6%) of them accessed
- services at University clinic and 36(27%) at UDUTH, Sokoto

# 278 Knowledge of the Scheme

- 279 Majority 246 (99.3%) of the respondents were aware of the NHIS, but over half 148 (53%) of the
- respondents had poor knowledge of the scheme (figure 1)
- 281

Figure 1: Bar Chart showing overall knowledge scores of the respondents on how NHISworks



- 287
- 288

# 289 Table 1. Respondents' perception of National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIS)

Variables	Agree (%)	Disagree (%)	Undecided (%)
Do you Consider NHIS service provides up to date medical services	120 (43.2)	136 (48.9)	22 (7.9)

NHIS has provided easy access to healthcare	168 (60.4)	92 (33.1)	18 (6.5)
I prefer NHIS services to the cash-and-carry system of healthcare	200 (71.9)	60 (21.6)	18(6.5)
Protect families from financial hardship of large medical bills.	220 (79.1)	52 (18.7)	6 (2.2)

Majority 200 (71.9%) of the respondents' preferred NHIS services than the cash and carry system of health care, 220(79.1%) agreed that it protects families from financial hardship and 168 (60.4%) felt the services provide easy access to healthcare. However almost half representing about 136 (48.9%) disagreed that NHIS provides up to date medical services

# 295 Table 2: Respondent satisfaction with the NHIS services

296

Variables	Satisfied (%)	Dissatisfied (%)	Undecided (%)	
Process of enrolment/registration with NHIS	34 (25)	92 (67.6)	10 (7.4)	
Waiting time at NHIS Clinic	52 (38.2)	80 (58.8)	4 (3)	
Attitude of NHIS staff	93 (68.4)	26 (19.1)	17 (12.5)	
Referral system	68 (50)	40 (29)	28 (21)	
Drugs received	29 (21.3)	99 (72.8)	8 (5.9)	
Investigation covered	68 (50)	60 (44.1)	8 (5.8)	
Co-payment plan	40 (29.4)	43 (31.6)	53 (39)	
Access to specialty care whenever needed	34 (25)	66 (48.5)	36(26.5)	
Overall scheme service	26 (19.1)	98 (72.1)	12 (8.8)	

A total of 278 Sample size of academic lecturer were use of which One hundred and thirty six academic lecturers representing 49.1% has enrolled into the scheme, 67.6% indicated their dissatisfaction with the process of enrolment while (68.4%) were satisfied with the attitude of NHIS staff. With regards to the waiting time at NHIS clinic, 58.8% were dissatisfied, and majority 72.8% were not satisfied with the drugs received at the NHIS pharmacy. However, majority 72.1% of the respondents did not satisfied with the overall scheme service. Overall

satisfaction of the program in this study shows 72% of the respondents dissatisfied with thescheme.

#### 306 **DISCUSSION**

Modal age of respondents was 40-49 years, while the mean age was 28.6.6±7.03. This falls 307 within the work-force age. Findings revealed that NHIS program appears to be well patronized 308 as majority of respondents were married, and whose family members are equally expected to 309 register as well with the scheme. Awareness of NHIS by the respondents in this study might be 310 due to the fact that almost all of respondents had tertiary education coupled with their working 311 312 environment which might make them to be conversant with any National health policy such as 313 NHIS in the country. This will enhance their awareness of the benefits of the scheme such as access to quality healthcare, prompt and adequate treatment of their ailments. The level of 314 315 awareness regarding the NHIS in this study was very high 99.3%. This is similar to study done by Sanusi et al in 2009 to assess the awareness level of NHIS among healthcare consumers in 316 Oyo state. Evans and Shisana found that awareness of the NHI in South Africa was very high, 317 318 with 90.8% of the respondents expressing that the NHIS should be a national priority and over 319 80% saying they would prefer it to the current healthcare system. Awareness about the NHI in 320 South Africa exceeded that of Uganda, where only 40.7% had heard about the proposed Social Health Insurance scheme and more than a half of the respondents (57.3%) had never heard about 321 322 it. This post-test level of awareness about NHIS might be attributed to the work of the Monash-323 Oxfam NHI project and their collaborating Partners who conducted community consultation 324 processes to raise awareness about the NHIS in these areas. In this study, 53% of the respondents 325 reported that they heard or became aware of the NHIS from friends and relatives, this is different from the study of Evans that found electronic media such as radio or television, as the main 326 sources and 38.3% said they heard or got information from a community organization 327

328 Knowledge about what the NHIS was generally poor. In this study 53% of the respondents did not know how the NHIS works. This is somehow different from finding of Ivabode et al (2017) 329 330 that found 51.4% had good knowledge while 48.6% had poor knowledge about NHIS program 331 and also to that of Salawudden (2011) in Kaduna found out that majority of the respondents 71.5% had good knowledge of what NHIS entailed and also similar to 332 from finding of Study by Geoffrey(2015) in South Africa on Public awareness and 333 knowledge of the NHIS among Client attending Hospital reveal that, 52.4% of the respondents 334 had knowledge of the NHI modalities while 44.6% did not know but different with the finding of 335 Olugbenga et al.(2010) on Knowledge and attitude of civil servants in Osun state, Southwestern 336 Nigeria towards the national health insurance. Shows none had good knowledge of the 337 components of NHIS, 26.7% knew about its objectives, and 30% knew about who ideally should 338 339 benefit from the scheme

Study by Awe and Sanusi 2009, shows about 72% of the respondents indicated that there was 340 delay in attending to them for health care services and 87% of respondents did not see any 341 significant difference between the services provided under the cash and carry system and the 342 NHIS. About half of the respondents perceived NHIS as a means to improve their health, some 343 of them perceived NHIS as being capable of providing prescribed drugs. However, some 344 respondents preferred to be given monthly medical allowance to take care of their health and that 345 of their dependents than receiving treatment under NHIS Some 147 (42%) of the respondents 346 rated NHIS services as good. In study by Alnaif, 2016 physician perception of health insurance 347 in Saudi Arabia physicians believed that accessibility is a major policy concern and that SHI will 348 have a positive effect on access to the health care system. 349

350

Among One hundred and thirty six academic lecturers representing 49.1% who enrolled into the scheme 67.6% indicated their dissatisfaction with the process of enrolment while (68.4%) were satisfied with the attitude of NHIS staff. With regards to the waiting time at NHIS clinic, 58.8% were dissatisfied, and majority 72.8% did not satisfied with the drugs received at the NHIS

pharmacy, however majority 72.1% of the respondents did not satisfied with the overall schemeservice.

Overall satisfaction of the program in this study shows 72% of the respondents dissatisfied with the scheme this is similar to the finding of Salawudden (2011) that shows 66% dissatisfaction with the program and 38% respondent enrolled in the program. Study conducted by Iyabode and Esther also reveal only, 48.6% respondents were satisfied with the services of the scheme

362 **Conclusions** 

Based on findings of this study, the respondents agreed that NHIS service provided easy access 363 to healthcare, protected families from financial hardship of large medical bills and preferred 364 NHIS services than cash and carry system of healthcare, but showed dissatisfaction in the 365 process of enrollment with the NHIS. This implies that the administrative part of the scheme was 366 very ineffective. Since registration is an administrative duty and the first process of enrolment 367 into NHIS, giving the first impression about the Scheme, the NHIS should give it the attention 368 needed towards ensuring enrollees' satisfaction, toward making the registration easier and 369 available at any time the wish to accessed it. 370

#### 371 **Recommendations**

372 The following recommendations were made:

Removal of all bottlenecks encountered in the registration process (examples delay in getting identification cards for accessing NHIS service) in order to fast track
registration of new and existing employees into the scheme, select Health
Maintenance Officer (HMO) and engaged them fully in rendering service to the
clients' at their convenience.

378 (II) Compulsory enrolment into the scheme should be enforced by the employers at the379 onset of recruitment process for all working Nigerians, starting with those working in

- government organizations. This will improve our dismal health indices as most
  Nigerians will then have access to better healthcare services without the encumbrance
  of large out of pocket expenses.
- (III) Health Maintenance Organizations and healthcare providers must realize that
  enrollees have the right to choose their service providers and change to another
  when not satisfied with services rendered. Therefore, it is recommended that every
  provider strive to provide the best of services and the monitoring agencies should
  step up their monitoring antennae in order to curb the menace of dissatisfaction which
  is fast becoming common place in the scheme.
- (IV) Several Nigerians are not fully enlightened in the components and structure of the
   NHIS. The researcher recommends a massive and far reaching enlightenment
   campaign in form of seminars, workshop and publications to educate the populace on
   the scheme.

#### **393 REFERENCES**

394

- Adeniyi AA, Onajole AT. 2010. National health insurance scheme: A survey of knowledge and
   opinions of Nigerian dentists in Lagos. Nigeria. African Journal of Medical Science.
   2010; 1(1)39:29–35.
- Aderounmu A.O, 1992. National Health Insurance scheme in Nigeria, www.oauife.edu.ng
   accessed 20/9/2017
- 401 Akande TM, Bello O (2002) National Health Insurance Scheme in Nig. Medilor J. 7(1)
- Alnaif, Muhammad S., (2005) "Physicians' Perception of Health Insurance in Saudi Arabia"
  Saudi Medical journal vol 27 pp. 693 699.
- Berelson, B and Steiner, G.A, (1964) Human Behaviour: An Inventory of Scientific findings,
   New York: Harcourt
- Carrin, G.,Doetincher ,D.,Kingia, J.,Mathauer,I.&Musago, L. (2011). Social Health Insurance. Low
  Feasible Is Its Expansion In The Africa region, International institute of social studies1 15)2011
  http://www.iss.nlayoutsetprintDevssuesArticlessocial-health-Insurancehow- feasible-is-it,retrival 1410-2011.

411

412

and experiences of healthcare providers and clients in two districts of Ghana; Health 413 Economics Review 2012 2(13) doi 10.1186/2191-1991-2-13 http://www.health 414 economics review. Come/content/2/1/13 415 Ibiwoye A, Adeleke IA. 2008. Does national health insurance promote access to quality health 416 417 care? Evidence from Nigeria. Nigeria. Geneva Papers on Risk and Insurance: Issues and Practice. 2008;33(1):219-233. DOI: 10.1057/gpp.2008.6 418 Iliyasu, Z., Abubakar, I.S., Abubakar, S., Lawan, U.M.& Gajida, A.U. (2010). Patients' 419 satisfaction with services obtained from Aminu Kano Teaching Hospital, Kano, 420 Northern Nigeria. Nigerian Journal of Clinical Practice 2010, 13, 371-8 421 Iyabode A, G. Esther O.F 2017. International journal of tropical diseases and health Perception 422 423 and Satisfaction of Employees with National Health Insurance Scheme Services: A Descriptive Study at University College Hospital, Ibadan, Nigeria. 22(1). P 1-12 424 425 Katibi IA, Akande AA, Akande, TM, (2003). Awareness and Attitude of Medical practitioners in 426 Ilorin towards National Health Insurance Scheme. Nig. Medical Practitioner Vol 43 No 2 427 Mensah, J., Oppong, J.R. & Bobi-Barimah . (2010). An evaluation of the Ghana national health 428 Insurance in the context of the health MDGs GDN Library Working paper series. 429 430 431 McIntyre D. 2007. Learning from experience: Health care financing in low and middle income 432 countries. Global Forum for Health Research, Geneva; 2007. 433 434 435 NHIS. 2005. National health insurance scheme operational guidelines. National Health Insurance Scheme Abuja, Nigeria; 2005. 436 Obalum, D.C.& Fiberesima, F. (2012). Nigerian National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIS): an 437 overview. The Nigerian Postgraduate medical journal 09/2012; 19(3); 167-74 438 439

Dalinjong, P.A.& Alenxander, S.L. (2012). The National Health Insurance Scheme: perceptions

- Olugbenga-Bello AI, Adebimpe WO. 2010. Knowledge and attitude of civil servants in Osun
   State, Southwestern Nigeria towards national health insurance scheme. Nigeria:
   Nigerian Journal of Clinical Practice. 2010; 13(4):421-6.
- Onyedibe, K. I, Goyit, M. G, Nnadi, N. E, 2012, An evaluation of the national health insurance
  scheme (NHIS) in Jos, a north-central Nigerian city, vol.(1) P005-012 Operational
  guideline- National health insurance scheme, June 2005, NHIS

447 448 449 450 451	Osuchukwu	a NC, Osonwa KO, Eko JE, Uwanede CC, Abeshi SE, Offiong DA. 2013. Evaluating the impact of national health insurance scheme on health care consumers in Calabar metropolis, Southern Nigeria. International Journal of Learning & Development. 2013;3(4):30. ISSN 2164-4063 Available:www.macrothink.org/ijld
451 452 453 454 455	Osungbade	KO, Obembe TA, Oludoyi A. 2014 Users' satisfaction with services provided under national health insurance scheme in Southwestern Nigeria. International Journal of Tropical Disease & Health. 2014; 4(5):595-607. Available: <u>www.sciencedomain.org</u>
456 457 458	Osungbade	, K.O., Obembi, T.A. & Oludoyi, A. (2014).Users' satisfaction with services provided under national health Insurance scheme in fourth Western Nigeria; International Journal of Tropical disease & Health 4(5) 2014 <u>www.sciencedomain.org</u>
459 460 461 462	Oyibo PG.	2011. Out-of-pocket payment for health services: Constraints and implications for government employees in Abakaliki, Ebonyi State, Southeastern, Nigeria. Nigeria. African Health Science. 2011;11(3):481–5.
463 464 465 466	Salawudder	n S.A 2008. Assessment of clients' satisfaction and quality of outpatient care under the national health insurance scheme at Barau Dikko specialist hospital Kaduna, Kaduna state, MPH Project asses at <u>www.kubanni.abu.edu.ng:8080</u>
467 468	Sanusi A, A	Awe AT 2009. An Assessment of awareness level of National Health Insurance among Healthcare consumers in Oyo state, Nigeria, 2009. Medwell Journals 4(2) 143- 148.
469 470 471 472	Sanusi RA	, Awe AT 2015. Perception of national health insurance scheme by health care consumers in Ibadan, Oyo State, Nigeria. Nigeria. Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences. 2015; 6(1):48-53.
473 474 475 476	Shafiu M,	Sambo MN 2009. Clients' satisfaction with health insurance scheme in Nigeria: The formal sector experience in the Northern Nigeria. Presentation at University of Heidelberg. Institute of Public Health, Germany; 2009.
477 478 479 480	Thinking	of introducing social health insurance by WHO, 2010 acessed at <a href="http://www.who.int/healthsystems/topic/financing/healthreport/26_10Q.pdf">http://www.who.int/healthsystems/topic/financing/healthreport/26_10Q.pdf</a> on

487 Awosusi A 2014. Health for All co-hosts national stakeholders meeting on UHC in Nigeria.

- 488 <u>http://www.msh.org/blog/2014/04/15/health-for-all-co-hosts-national-stakeholders-meeting-</u>
   489 <u>on-uhc-in-nigeria</u>
- 490 Uzochukwu B .Ughasoro MD .Etiaba E .Okwuosa C .Envuladu E .Onwujekwe OE 2015.
  491 Health care financing in Nigeria: implications for achieving universal health coverage
  492 Niger J Clin Pract. 2015; 18: 437-444
- 493WHO 2002. Global Health Observatory Data Repository. Nigeria: statistics summary (2002–494present). <a href="http://apps.who.int/gho/data/node.country.country.NGA">http://apps.who.int/gho/data/node.country.NGA</a>
- 495 Uzochukwu B .Onwujekwe O .Mbachu C 2015. Implementing the Basic Health Care
  496 Provision Fund in Nigeria: a framework for accountability and good governance.
  497 RESYST (Resilient and Responsive Health Systems) Research Consortium, London;
  498 2015
- 499

501