SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	**Asian Journal of Environment & Ecology**
Manuscript Number:	**Ms_AJEE_41004**
Title of the Manuscript:	**Removal of heavy metals Cd (II), Fe (III) and Ni (II), from aqueous solutions by natural (clinoptilolite) zeolites and application to industrial wastewater**
Type of the Article	**Original Research Article**

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty'**, provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.
To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline)

SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	**Author's comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Compulsory REVISION comments	**please use my feedbacks before as a guide to further improve the quality of your work where you see fit.** **Note. Adsorption expt using clinoptilolite for removal of Cd(II), Ni (II) and Fe(III) had been studied before and published in many papers. What is the actual point of repeating? Is the data reported in this manuscript significantly different from those reported in literature? Please clarify.** **Abstract: Please correct the punctuations. The word "Zeolite" does not need to be in capital letter (please correct for the whole manuscript). Abstract should be short and concise. Please shorten the long sentences and rewrite them more concisely. Incomplete last sentence. Remove all unnecessary details.** **Line40: Al3+. The charge was not superscripted.** **line 43: Na+1, Ca+2, Mg+2. Na+1 can be written as just "Na^{+}". Don't forget to superscript the charges. Please do so for the rest of the manuscript.** **Line 63-64. Authors need to be consistent labelling the species of the metal ions. Fe (III) or Fe^{3+}. But don't leave it as Fe. (pls correct for the rest of the manuscript)** **Section 2.1.2. Where exactly is the industry wastewater from? What industry was it? Please clarify because author stated "industrial wastewater treatment plant" and doesn't it indicated that the wastewater in the "outlet" has already been treated? Yet in Table 4, the outlet is still highly polluted?** **section 2.2.1 to 2.2.5 can be written concisely in one paragraph. Keep it brief and simple without repetition.** **Line 134: qe is amount of dissolved adsorbed material! Not absorbed.** **line 137: What is Co represent? Or should it be Ci?** **Authors are not citing Langmuir and Fruendlich to the correct references. Please take note that authors of original work should deserve to be credited.** **The correct citations are as followed:** **Langmuir, I. (1916). The constitution and fundamental properties of solids and liquids. Journal of the American Chemical Society. 38, 2221-2295** **Freundlich, H. M. F. (1906). Over the adsorption in solution. Journal of Physical Chemistry. 57, 385-471** **Table 2's description seem to be incomplete.** **Figures 3, 4, 5,6 x-axis should be in Arabic numeral, not in Arabic alphabet** **Figures' caption, please replace the SI unit "gr" to "g", and use "t" for time instead of T. Big capital T is usually used as symbol for temperature.** **"adsorbent dosage" or "adsorbent dose"? Please just use one term and not both simultaneous so there the terminology is consistent throughout manuscript.** **Decide how to refer to "Figure" in text. I had observed authors used "Figure 5", "figure 1", and "Fig. 4". Please check if journal has requirement to use a certain term. Otherwise, just consistently use one format throughout manuscript. Also**	Although the global use of this type of zeolite, the Egyptian is rarely used in the Egyptian environment remediation , despite its existence as raw material with very large quantities, it is available at the cheapest prices and because the city of Suez overlooking the Red Sea is concentrated in many types of industries and therefore the use this zeolite has a practical and economic application for the region and the surrounding environment, in particular to reduce pollution to the affected marine environment. The correction applied to the manuscript Thank you for advice

	Usually "Table 1" is used, and never been shorten to "Tab 1". (line 297) **Line 297. Which Figure is referred to?** **Figure 7 is not required as information has been summarised in Table 3. There is no need for a duplication of effort.** **Are there no kinetics model included in this studies?** **No heading label for "application test on industrial wastewater"?** **For the industrial wastewater. What the pH adjusted to optimum conditions?**	
Minor REVISION comments		
Optional/General comments		