



SDI Review Form 1.6

|                          |                                                                                                                                                          |
|--------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">Asian Journal of Environment &amp; Ecology</a>                                                                                               |
| Manuscript Number:       | Ms_AJEE_37021                                                                                                                                            |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Highly Efficient Treatment Of Shrimp Farm Wastewater By Using The Horizontal Subsurface flow (HSSF) Constructed Wetlands With Phragmites australis Plant |
| Type of the Article      | Original research papers                                                                                                                                 |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:



SDI Review Form 1.6

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p>The article is interesting but some clarifications are necessary:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. More recent references in the first part of the Introduction;</li> <li>2. The quality indicators legislation values must be presented;</li> <li>3. A plants evaluation description during and after application should be made (growth, size...);</li> <li>4. Installation efficiency should be verified without plants. It is possible to obtain interesting performance without plants and also the comparison is interesting.</li> <li>5. The numbering of the reference list.</li> </ol> | <p>Thanks very much for you valuable comment to help me for improving my manuscript. Our answers are bellow:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Thank you very much. We have added three more recent references in the introduction section. The update information from new references is indicated by red colour in the revised manuscript (Line 54-57; Line 61-66 and Line 95-101).</li> <li>2. Thank you very much for your comment. We have added more information about the quality indicators legislation values in Line 276-278" This result could achieve the recycle requirement of the National technical regulation on industry wastewater of Vietnam type A, QCVN 24:2009/BTNMT (COD: 50 mg L<sup>-1</sup>; TN: 15 mg L<sup>-1</sup>; NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N: 5 mg L<sup>-1</sup>; TP: 4 mg L<sup>-1</sup>)"</li> <li>3. Thank you very much for your comment. We have added more information about plants during the experiment at Line 126-127 and Line 168-173.<br/>"In addition, the Phragmites australis plants were grown stably in the operational period with the average height as at 1m, density at 25 pieces.m<sup>-2</sup>. During this time, more branches of Phragmites australis were sprouted and some old branches were cut out to maintain the density of plant in the model. There was not significantly different of plant characteristics during the experiment of phase 1 and phase 2".</li> <li>4. Thank you very much for your valuable comment. Unfortunately, we don't have data for the model without plants. However, this comment is very remarkable for us to set-up model for further research in future.</li> <li>5. Thank you very much. We have revised the number of reference list to be in order.</li> </ol> |
| <b>Minor</b> REVISION comments      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |