



**SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1**

**PART 1:**

|                          |                                                        |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | Asian Journal of Economics, Business and Accounting    |
| Manuscript Number:       | Ms_AJEBA_33095                                         |
| Title of the Manuscript: | STRATEGIC USE OF EXIT INTERVIEWS: THE ART OF RETENTION |
| Type of Article:         | Original Research Article                              |

**PART 2:**

| FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | Authors' response to final evaluator's comments                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>I really appreciate qualitative work.</p> <p>However, I asked for statistics of analysis (Especially software used for analysis, how did you code a theme, frequency statistics of extracted words) in table and coding formats and it is still missing.</p> <p>Sorry, you have to organize output in tables using codes and themes extracted from interviews. Follow guidelines @</p> <p><a href="http://utsc.utoronto.ca/~kmacd/IDSC10/Readings/text%20analysis/themes.pdf">http://utsc.utoronto.ca/~kmacd/IDSC10/Readings/text%20analysis/themes.pdf</a></p> <p><a href="http://s3.amazonaws.com/academia.edu.documents/46208392/53e317510cf2b9d0d832cb47.pdf?AWSAccessKeyId=AKIAIWOWYYGZ2Y53UL3A&amp;Expires=1492072382&amp;Signature=j4%2FdkPWtb%2BJEoXtrcbdGpnkyS%2Fc%3D&amp;response-content-disposition=inline%3B%20filename%3DContent_analysis_and_thematic_analysis_1.pdf">http://s3.amazonaws.com/academia.edu.documents/46208392/53e317510cf2b9d0d832cb47.pdf?AWSAccessKeyId=AKIAIWOWYYGZ2Y53UL3A&amp;Expires=1492072382&amp;Signature=j4%2FdkPWtb%2BJEoXtrcbdGpnkyS%2Fc%3D&amp;response-content-disposition=inline%3B%20filename%3DContent_analysis_and_thematic_analysis_1.pdf</a></p> | <p><b>Thank you so much for the revised review comments. We would humbly request the reviewer to read through our reply comments till the very end (since it's a bit lengthy..sorry about that).</b></p> <p><b>Summary Table:</b></p> <p><b>A summary table on study findings has been furnished in the result discussion section up front as per the recommendation of the reviewer.</b></p> <p><b>Use of software:</b></p> <p>Perhaps the reviewer is looking for use of NVivo or some other software for qualitative research analysis which was <b>NOT</b> used in this paper.</p> <p><b>Why?</b></p> <p>Because this paper deals with manually manageable data (3 policy level HR personnel from three companies. The respondents are from core HR team of their company and know inside out about their exit interview practice).</p> <p><b>Is it enough?</b></p> <p><b>Yes it is.</b> A case study can be done on "a single company" or even on "an individual" and can be used as empirical data source. We have given the due reference in methodology part. Where one case can be handy, we have used three cases (multiple case study method.)</p> <p><b>Misunderstanding:</b></p> <p>Perhaps there is some sort of misunderstanding between the reviewer(s) and the authors in terms of method of this study and analysis tool being used.</p> <p>Please <b>NOTE</b> that in this paper authors have used '<u>multiple case studies</u>' <u>research method</u> and '<u>thematic coding</u>' as the <u>analytical tool</u> for result analysis. In case studies, sample size is mostly small and manually manageable. So frequency statistics do not carry much importance in such study context.</p> <p>Moreover, use of NVivo or any other software is just an option to deal with large data where frequency statistics may carry meaningful insight which is clearly not the case here in this paper. The basic coding input, even in case of software, is based on the interpretation and understanding of the researcher(s).</p> <p><b>'Thematic Coding Analysis' Vs 'Thematic Networks Analysis'</b></p> <p><b>Even the pdf referred by the reviewer (link is given below)</b></p> <p><a href="http://utsc.utoronto.ca/~kmacd/IDSC10/Readings/text%20analysis/themes.pdf">http://utsc.utoronto.ca/~kmacd/IDSC10/Readings/text%20analysis/themes.pdf</a></p> <p>makes it clear that 'Thematic Networks Analysis' is a bit advanced mode of qualitative research that involves salient theme(s) identification and then <b>structuring</b> the themes as a subsequent step. (Reference: page 387 (last paragraph) of the utoronto.ca pdf (the reviewer provided the document.). Moreover, in 'Thematic Networks Analysis', the <u>thematic networks</u> are only a tool in analysis, <b>NOT the analysis itself</b>. Once a thematic network has been constructed, it (thematic network) will then serve as an organizing principle and an <b>illustrative tool</b> in the interpretation. (here frequency stats are important)</p> |



**SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1**

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | <p><b>[Reference:</b> page 389 (last paragraph) of the utoronto.ca pdf which is referred by the reviewer.]</p> <p>Please <b>NOTE</b> that this paper used simple thematic coding as described by Marshall and Rossman (1999) for finding out salient themes from the interviews but did NOT use “The Thematic Network Analysis’ where frequency stats based illustration is a key part.</p> <p>This paper is based on 3 case studies only. Hence, <u>what</u> is said (salient theme) is more important than <u>how many times (frequency)</u> it is said. That is why, frequency stats based illustration was not emphasized. Data size is a limitation of this study, always in case of case study method, and has been addressed in ‘Limitations’ section of the paper.</p> <p><b>Now about the question of coding theme and sub themes:</b></p> <p>The broad two themes (Theme A: Intentions behind exit interview practice; and Theme B: Strategic use of exit interview information) are the main research quests of the authors which surfaced from the literature review.</p> <p><b>Why:</b> No studies answer these questions from Bangladesh context. Hence, the authors felt the need to investigate the mentioned phenomenon.</p> <p><b>Emergence of sub-themes (study findings):</b></p> <p>Sub-themes under broad themes (A &amp; B) surfaced from the interview discussions. These are the main study findings. Audio-taped in-depth interviews were converted to ‘interview transcripts’ first. Then sub-themes were extracted from interview transcripts through “<u>Interpretive Reading</u>” as proposed by Mason (2002; p. 148-150)<br/>Some of the key comments of the respondents were quoted under each sub-theme to strengthen the findings.</p> <p>To conclude, we would humbly request the reviewer(s) again to primarily consider the difference between case study method based qualitative research and relatively large data set based (non-case study) qualitative research. And lastly, we draw your kind attention to the fact that use of software is NOT a rule but an OPTION to manage data better. Thank you so much for your patient reading.</p> |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|