



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2013_AJEA_7200
Title of the Manuscript:	EFFECTS OF DIFFERENT APPLICATION RATES OF SINGLE SUPER PHOSPHATE ON THE PERFORMANCE, NUTRIENT UPTAKE AND NODULATION OF PIGEON PEA IN DEGRADED ULTISOL

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
Under "Experimental Design" line 78 – fertilizer rate, should read, fertilizer rates Still the data is not correctly fitted to a model and more so the results leading to Table 1 and 4 which, obviously, are in longitudinal setting. Graphical presentation would also have given more clearly changes within a season and comparison between the two seasons. The paper can be accepted for publication now and the author need to whet biometry content, more conclusion and recommendations will be made in a different presentation. As of now suffice it to say, though biometry content of the paper is weak, there is some good work and result to show. In the conclusion it is observed that application rate of P can be based on the intention of having the crop ie cover crop -75, grains - 25, erosion control -75, fodder crop – 50. This means there was much more, that would have been included in here from the work. Author needs to note, there no sound comparison between performance of the two seasons the work was carried out.	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	John A. Mwangi
Department, University & Country	Natural Resources Management, Kenya Agricultural Research Institute, Kenya