



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2013_AJEA_4929
Title of the Manuscript:	The Relationship between Phenotypic, Testicular Traits and Serum Testosterone Levels in Pre-pubertal Male Boer Goat Crosses

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The authors did not address the issues to meet the criteria for publication of this paper. There were several suggestions that were made to make this paper publishable, instead of rejecting it first time around. However, the authors did not make the requested changes by the third revision. The scientific content is justified and the study is well executed, but the presentation of the work is not at the level that is required for publication yet. I would like to encourage the authors to revise the paper accordingly, using the suggestions made by the reviewers and try to publish it at another stage.	<p>We strongly disagree with this assertion; we tried to the best of ability to accommodate comments, suggestions and many concerns of this and other reviewers. We have attached a Please see a detailed list of suggestions and how they were addressed. This action be verified by the two checkmarks (✓ and X) the reviewer used to indicate acceptance or lack of acceptance.</p> <p>We will abide any decision of the editorial board regarding the suitability of the manuscript for publication.</p>

ABSTRACT	
Reviewers Required Changes	Author's Revision
Week 6 through week 12 (23.22± 0.86cm, 31.95 ± 2.64kg, 24.53 ±1.43cm, 34.72 ± 2.98kg, 26.05 ±1.35cm, and 37.46 ± 3.44kg),	In addition, SC (23.22± 0.86cm, 31.95 ± 2.64kg, and 24.53 ±1.43cm) and BW (34.72 ± 2.98kg, 26.05 ±1.35cm, and 37.46 ± 3.44kg) increased ($P < .01$) linearly from week 6 through week 12, respectively.
INTRODUCTION	
<p>Lines 21-22: To make genetic gain in the meat goat industry, there is a requirement to determine superior Boer meat goat sires within the population and increase their use.</p> <p>Lines 59-60: A significant positive correlation was found at seven to eight months age [10] between all testicular measurements, semen volume and motility.</p>	<p>Genetic progress in the meat goat industry requires the identification of superior meat goat sires.</p> <p>A significant positive correlation was found at seven to eight months of age between all testicular measurements, semen volume and motility [10]. Scrotal circumference could provide useful estimate of testicular growth, as its correlations with other testicular measurements were the highest, and 60 this information could be used as selection criteria for ram lambs at an early age.</p>
MATERIALS AND METHODS	
Lines 99-105: A measuring tape was used to determine shoulder width (the horizontal distance between the processes on the left shoulder to those on the 100 right shoulder blade), chest girth (the width around the chest just behind the front legs), body length (the distance from the sternum to the aitch	A measuring tape was used to determine shoulder width (the horizontal distance between the processes on the left shoulder to those on the right shoulder blade), chest girth (the width around the chest just behind the front legs), body length (the distance from the sternum to the aitch bone), hip width (the



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

bone), hip width (the distance between the left and right femur bones). The height at wither (determined with the aid of a metric ruler as the vertical length from the thoracic vertebrae to the ground).	distance between the left and right femur bones). The height at wither (the vertical length from the thoracic vertebrae to the ground) was determined with the aid of a metric ruler.
RESULTS & DISCUSSION	
<p>Lines 148-150: The means and standard deviations for phenotypic traits, testicular traits and serum testosterone levels (TT) are shown in Tables 1. The average SC at week 0 was (22.87±2.42cm), with a slight decline into week 3 (22.54±1.77cm).</p> <p>Lines 152 – 153: Table 1. The Effect of Week on Body Conformation, Testicular Traits, Serum Testosterone at week 0, 3, 6, 9, and 12)* in Pubertal Male Boer Crosses.</p> <p>Lines 164-165: Also, there was a decline in TT level at week 6 (7.48±8.25ng/ml), and week 9 showed an all time high (27.85±14.42ng/ml), followed by a decline at week 12 (10.74±14.40ng/ml).</p> <p>Lines 172: 521± 0.311 to 3.417± 2.021ng/ml) in Boer goats starting from 1 month to 8 months of age during dry and rainy seasons.</p> <p>Line 199: BW and SC (r = 0.93; r = 0.88) young Boer bucks.</p> <p>Line 210-212: However, testicular size was found to have a higher correlation with body weight than serum testosterone level in pubertal male Boer crosses.</p>	<p>The means and standard deviations for body conformation, testicular traits 147 and serum testosterone levels (TT) are shown in Tables 1.</p> <p>Table 1. Body Conformation, Testicular Traits, Serum Testosterone in Pre-pubertal Male Boer Goat Crosses.</p> <p>Also, there was a decline ($P = .11$) in TT level at week 6/173 d of age (7.48±8.25ng/ml), and week 9/194 d of age showed an all time high (27.85±14.42ng/ml), followed by a decline at week 12/215 d of age (10.74±14.40ng/ml).</p> <p>521± 0.311 to 3.417± 2.021ng/ml) in Boer goats starting from 1 month to 8 months 172 of age during dry and rainy seasons. (r = 0.30; r = 0.43), SC (r = 0.42; r = 0.52), and BW and SC (r = 0.93; r = 0.88) in young Boer bucks.</p> <p>However, scrotal circumference was found to have a higher correlation with body weight than serum testosterone level in pubertal male Boer crosses.</p>
CONCLUSIONS	
Line 234: There was an intricate relationship among testosterone concentrations, testicular volume, and various body conformation traits.	There was an intricate relationship among testosterone concentrations, scrotal circumference, and various body conformation traits.
REFERENCES	
<p>Line 261-263: Casey NH vanNiekerk WA. The Boer goat. I. Origin, adaptability, performance testing, reproduction and milk production. Small Ruminant Research, 1988; 1(3): 291-302.</p> <p>Line 310: Ugwu, SOC. Relationship between Scrotal Circumference, In Situ Testicular Measurements and Sperm Reserves in West African Dwarf Bucks. African Journal of Biotechnology, 2009; 8(7):1354-1357</p>	<p>Casey NH vanNiekerk WA. The Boer goat. I. Origin, Adaptability, Performance Testing, Reproduction, and Milk Production. Small Ruminant Research, 1988; 1(3): 291-302.</p> <p>Ugwu, SOC. Relationship between Scrotal Circumference, <i>In Situ</i> Testicular Measurements and Sperm Reserves in West African Dwarf Bucks. African Journal of Biotechnology, 2009; 8(7):1354-1357</p>