



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_28153
Title of the Manuscript:	EFFECTS OF LIME AND NITROGEN RATES ON SOIL PROPERTIES AND NUTRIENT CONTENT OF SUGARCANE – SOYBEAN INTERCROPPED ON ACIDIFIED SOILS OF KIBOS, KISUMU COUNTY IN KENYA
New title:	EFFECTS OF LIME AND NITROGEN RATES ON PROPERTIES OF AN ACIDIC SOIL AND NUTRIENT CONTENT OF SUGARCANE – SOYBEAN INTERCROPPED IN KENYA
Type of Article:	Original Research Article

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The paper is well improved and some questions and review comments made were addressed. The language use in the manuscript has improved. The role played by intercropping is not clearly explained or discussed in this paper. On L 34-36: The benefits of sugarcane soybean intercropping are diverse crops yield, increased income, nutrition and also biological nitrogen fixation (BNF) which cut costs on the use of N fertilizers and therefore reduce soil N mining [42]. Specifically in this study? What was the benefit of intercropping? Why intercropping? L115: Lime per rate was applied prior planting. How long prior planting was lime applied? L191-193: Did CEC in this also study increase with decrease with Zn? L 196: Nitrogen rate affected only available P for 15-30 cm depth. Explain how did that happen? L228-229: The more sugarcane leaf nutrients content noted in sugarcane plots shallow banded with lime was perhaps due to enhanced uptake of the nutrients at 0 – 15 cm depth. What could have influenced nutrients content in sugarcane leaf? The paper was improved even though there are outstanding issues especially regarding the concept of soybean intercropping? Still the question was not answered. The discussion of this paper is based on Lime and Nitrogen rates. It will have been better if the title was "Effect of lime and Nitrogen rate on properties of an acidic soil and nutrient content of sugarcane in Kenya".	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Mushia Nicacias
Department, University & Country	Agricultural Research Council, South Africa