



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_26874
Title of the Manuscript:	Evaluation of Selected French Bean (<i>Phaseolus vulgaris</i> L.) Genotypes for Resistance to Angular Leaf Spot (<i>Pseudocercospora griseola</i>) in Western Kenya
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	Lack of data supporting disease effects on pod yield and quality. Alternate analysis of data (nonparametric statistics and Area Under Disease Progress Curve) must to be considered. Pathogen isolation and characterization are required in order to determine race, pathogenicity, aggressiveness and virulence. Determination of host Genotype x Environment interaction is required to assess stability of plant disease resistance.	
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	Uniform use of symbols is suggested ($^{\circ}\text{C}$ must be changed for $^{\circ}\text{C}$; line 132). Recommendations must be supported by the obtained data. Sites for French bean germplasm screening for ALS resistance need to be corroborated due to significant variation observed for pathogen diversity and incidence levels across locations and years. Marker assisted selection (MAS) also need to be considered. Parent selection and breeding programs need to be implemented in order to increment ALS resistance levels in French beans cultivated in western Kenya. French beans represent a group in common bean germplasm, only two genepools are recognized (Andean and Mesoamerican).	



SDI Review Form 1.6

<u>Optional/General</u> comments	Lack of discussion for the escape influence (phenology effects) on cultivar field response to pathogen incidence. Escape could be related to the moderate level of resistance against ALS observed in some cultivars. According to CIAT's standard system, recommended phenological stages for pathogen evaluation are R₆ (flowering stage) and R₈ (seed filling period).	
---	---	--

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Anonymous
Department, University & Country	<i>Instituto Nacional de Investigaciones Forestales, Agrícolas y Pecuarias, Mexico</i>