



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_26703
Title of the Manuscript:	PHENOTYPIC RESPONSE OF ORYZA SPECIES SEEDLINGS TO SALINE CONDITIONS
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments		
Minor REVISION comments	Page 1 Abstract Line 1: <i>Oryza</i> species Page 1 Abstract Line 1: <i>O. barthii</i> Page 1 Abstract Line 9: Philippines and <i>Africa Rice</i>, Page 1 Abstract Line 11-12: with <i>NaCl</i> at EC 12dSm⁻¹ and pH 5.2 for 28 days in a hydroponic system. Page 1 Abstract Line 18: (increased <i>leaves</i> number Page 1 Abstract Line 31: at 12dSm⁻¹. Page 2 Line 38: <i>O. barthii</i> Page 2 Line 41-42: the tolerant and susceptible checks respectively. Sterilization and Pre-germination Page 2 Line 48-49: soluble fertilizer supplemented with 0.1gL⁻¹ 48 of <i>Ferrous sulphate</i> (FeSO₄). Screening for Salt Tolerance Page 2 Line 48-49: maintained as described for the saline treatment. Phenotyping for Salinity Tolerance Page 2 Line 60-63: <i>leaves</i> number, shoot fresh weight (mg), <i>root dry weight</i> (mg), <i>shoot dry weight</i> (mg),	



SDI Review Form 1.6

	61 root/shoot (mg), root dry weight/shoot dry weight (mg), shoot fresh weight/root fresh weight (mg) and leaf width (cm). Statistical Analysis Page 3 Line 84: (Fig 2). Page 4 Line 101-102: genotypes. (Figure 4) Leaves Number Page 4 Line 105: showed an increase in leaves numbers. Page 4 Line 105-108: showed increase in leaves numbers. The mean effect of salinity in the reduction of leaves number was 12% (Figure 3). Tolerant and moderately tolerant genotypes showed lower reductions in leaves number as 107 against susceptible genotypes. Tillers Number (TN) Tillers numbers varied considerably Page 4 Line 115-116: with 50% reduction in tillers and presented the highest mean reduction in tillers amongst species (Fig 4). Leaf Width (LW) Page 4 Line 120-121: and <i>O. barthii</i> showed leaf width reductions of 32.47%, 33.01%, 50.63% and 53.14% respectively (Fig 4). Root Length (RL) Page 5 Line 126-127: 15.41% and 21.92% were obtained for <i>O. sativa</i>, <i>O. barthii</i> and <i>O. glaberrima</i> respectively (Fig 4).	
--	---	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Shoot Fresh Weight (SFW) Page 5 Line 134-135: 4). Shoot Dry Weight (SDW) Page 5 Line 141-142: reductions respectively (Fig 4). Root Fresh Weight (RFW) Page 5 Line 146-147: 52.87% respectively (Fig 4). Root Dry Weight (RDW) Page 5 Line 150-153: NERICA showed a lower mean reduction in root dry weight of 50.35%. Mean reduction obtained for <i>O. sativa</i> and <i>O. glaberrima</i> genotypes were 56.62% and 57.04% respectively. <i>Oryza barthii</i> recorded the highest mean reduction of 72.49% (fig 4). Plant Height to Root Length (PH/RL) Page 5 Line 158-159: <i>barthii</i> (40%), <i>O. sativa</i> (40.08%) and lastly NERICA with a value of 49.40% (Fig 4). Shoot Fresh Weight to Root Fresh Weight Ratio (SFW/RFW). Page 5 Line 164-165: 45.1% and 18.9% respectively. Root Dry Weight to Shoot Dry Weight (RDW/SDW) Page 5 Line 168: (Fig 3) Page 7 Line 197: tillers number Page 7 Line 202: the leaves and tillers number produced Page 7 Line 207: Increased tillers and leaves number	
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Page 7 Line 224: on <i>leaves</i> number, Page 8 Line 255: <i>Oryza</i> species Page 8 Line 279: (<i>Oryza sativa</i> L.) Page 9 Line 305: (<i>Pennisetu mglaucum</i> L.R. br.). <i>Acta</i> <i>Physiolgy of</i> Page 9 Line 313: <i>Hordeum vulgare</i> Page 10 Line 328: <i>glaberrima</i> Steud:progenies	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		

Reviewer Details:

Name:	<i>Bahaa El Din Mekki</i>
Department, University & Country	<i>Field Crops Research Dept. National Research Centre, Egypt</i>