



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_28113
Title of the Manuscript:	Growth and yield of maize (Zea mays L.) as influenced by integrated weed management under temperate conditions of North Western Himalayas
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	No mention is made of weeds being present in the study area until page 6. Also the authors do not mention why atrazine and isoproturon were selected as herbicides to use in this study. Are these commonly used herbicides in the area? Explain. Also see comments below. L8.. Give location of XCSIR-IIIM, delete kharif, use other descriptive terms to explain growing season. L10..pre-emergence (PRE), use PRE hereafter throughout manuscript; also kg ai ha⁻¹ L12.. 'at par' explain L23-32..citation(s) are needed for each statement(s) L26..'throughout the country' be more specific. What countrie(s)? L41-42..proliferate and many weed species... L42..New paragraph. Weed infestations result in severe reduction in crop yield with corn losses reported to be 40 to 60% [4]. L47-48..Weed management practices play a great role in increasing maize yields. Farmers usually give more importance to cultural practices and ... L50-51..when manual labor is difficult to employ; therefore, other method of weed control are more feasible and less laborious,... L53..New paragraph; Several weed species that are strong competitors and compete with the maize crop and	Weed of the study area added. Yes they are commonly used herbicides in the study area Added, Kharif is a technical term, if it is not correct then you are requested to suggest a suitable term Done as desired 'at par' means 'statistically similar', it is also a technical term Citation added Added Done Done Done Done Done



SDI Review Form 1.6

	thus yields are decreased. L57..method; therefore, integrated... L59..levels. L60..weeds, they prove... L65..define 'knarif' L68..80% L77..postemergence (POST) with.. L78..previous crop? L82..between plants and rows, respectively. L82-83..fertilizer rates? L84..were banded as.. L85-86..knee high means nothing, give specific height ranges L90..Five randomly selected maize plants.. L92..knee high is not a phenological stage L110..5% L119..see L85-86 comments L124..you list reference [5] but where is [6]? L134.. this is the first mention of weeds being present in study area. Need to mention weed species, densities and height at time of POST treatments. L137-141..how does explaining how atrazine functions play into this discussion of the effects of high weed densities? L141..start new paragraph with "Significantly... L145..again "the severe competition of weeds" is	Done Done Done 'kharif' means summer crop Done Done Previous crop means "the crop which was grown before planting of maize on the same piece of land" Done Added Done See the references where knee high is taken as a phenological stage (Ritchie, S.W. And Hanway, J.J. et al. How a corn plant develops. July, 2005., Importance of corn growth stages and crop head units. Source: www. DEKALB.ca. Done See reply for comment L. 85-86 Done Done Done As already mentioned weed species in the introduction some of them were present during the post treatment. The word 'high' indicates here 'more' not 'height' and atrazine has a function to bind with the plasto quinine-binding protein in photosynthesis II which causes weed death due to starvation and oxidative damage and thereby reduces the weed growth. Done
--	---	---



SDI Review Form 1.6

	mentioned without any discussion in M&M section. L155.start new paragraph with "This The study revealed.... L168..[7,9,13] place in numerical order L175-176..due to atrazine applied PRE allowed.. L187-188..These results are similar to other reported research [9,17,18]. L202..[15,20] L210..[7,21] Table 1. 'Knee high' is not a growth stage Plant height expressed as cm? Leaf area index and dry matter production expressed as ? Table 3. These values are expressed as ?	Done Done Done Done Done Done Done See reply for comment L. 85-86 Done LAI- leaf area per plant/ ground surface per plant (1200 sq.cm) and dry matter production has been recorded as qtl/ ha. Done
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	This manuscript contains so good information but compulsory comments need to be addressed.	All the suggestions and comments have been addressed as desired.