



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_26874
Title of the Manuscript:	Evaluation of Selected French Bean (<i>Phaseolus vulgaris</i> L.) Genotypes for Resistance to Angular Leaf Spot (<i>Pseudocercospora griseola</i>) in Western Kenya
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	From the literature there seems to be high diversity for the pathogen causing angular leaf spot in Kenya, a fact that the authors did not consider. Even the actual distribution of physiological races per region-location seems to be known. M&M The specific planting dates and weather parameters (minimum temperatures, rainfall and relative humidity) for each test location need to be shown to facilitate the interpretation and discussion of their results. The disease score readings were taken from the 1st trifoliate leaf stage to pod formation, but in the Table 2 the authors do not state what are the means presented, i.e. a single reading across replicates or an average across growth stages during the cycle ? In the Discussion authors need to distinguish locally bred cultivars from those introduced and since the pathogenic variation of the fungus is high, it may be that the new cultivars need more than one resistant gene to cope with the disease. In Table 2 there are several intermediate genotypes (with the needed quality) that must be considered important for a future breeding effort along with Mexico 54. If these genotypes with intermediate resistance across sites are of Andean origin, perhaps they carry different	Distribution of races not fully captured as there is constant emergence of new races. Corrected average across growth stages during the cycle ? there exist no locally bred varieties.



SDI Review Form 1.6

	resistance genes than Mexico 54. Elite varieties were mentioned but not indicated and they must be included in a backcrossing sort of breeding effort. ALS is a disease widely distributed in East Africa, Central and South America (Brazil), the introduction of improved germplasm from those countries and from CIAT, Colombia could render more resistant sources for the local breeding program. Need to change the conclusion to indicate that promising intermediate genotypes were identified across the test sites, i.e. Andete, Samantha, and outstanding genotypes at specific sites such as Julia in Eldoret.	
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	Although the authors conducted an analysis including sites and genotypes, not mention was done on G by E interaction. There seem to be small mistakes on some of the averages calculated in Table 2, such as the one of cultivar Serengueti	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	Although French bean is an important crop in Kenya, most cultivars are from abroad, intrinsically, they are susceptible to diseases prevalent in Kenya. Since the crop is for export the quality must be assessed during breeding for high yield and disease resistance.	