



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_25620
Title of the Manuscript:	Population dynamics of P. brassicae on different cauliflower genotypes
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	The manuscript represents a useful study on population dynamics of insect pest <i>Pieris brassicae</i> with respect to different cauliflower genotypes. The experimental data are presented adequately, including adequate statistical evaluation, and clear conclusions are formulated. However, I have several comments on the manuscript: 1/ Terminology: I do not understand some terms used by the authors are not very clear, e.g., Conclusion, line 237: "It is concluded that all heightened genotypes have more larval population than short height genotypes." The terms "heighted genotypes" and "short height genotypes" have to be clearly explained by the authors. I think about "high-yielding genotypes" and "low-yielding genotypes", but I am not sure. 2/ The name of the cauliflower genotype "Snow grece" is also written as "Snow greece" - the authors should check that (or maybe it should name "Snow grace"?) 3/ Statistical evaluation of the data: There is missing any information on data statistical evaluation in Materials and methods section including statistical software used and statistical methods applied. In Table 1 and Table 2, results of LSD 0.05 test are summarised; however, in Table 3, there are only significance levels given but no statistical test is specified. The information on statistical software used and statistical methods applied has to be given in Materials and methods. In Table 3, statistical test used for data evaluation has to be specified. 4/ References:	heighted genotypes means genotype have maximum plant height. Done Done Done Done



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Missing references - the following references cited in the manuscript text are missing in the Reference list - they have to be added there: Line 175: Harper 1989; Line 177: Rhoades 1979; Line 180: The reference "Gutbrodt (2012)" has to be cited as "Gutbrodt et al. 2012" according to the Reference list since there are four authors in this reference. 5/ Formal comments: The full name of the insect pest "<i>Pieris brassicae</i>" has to be given in the manuscript title, i.e., "Population dynamics of <i>Pieris brassicae</i> on different cauliflower genotypes" Abstract, line 6 and further in the manuscript text: Check the cultivar's name "Snow grece" or "Snow greece" (or maybe "Snow grace"?) Abstract, line 9: Insert a space between a number and a corresponding unit in "361.83 larvae plant⁻¹" Abstract, line 10: Use a plural form of the verb "were" instead of a singular form "was" in the sentence "And no larvae were recorded on..." Abstract, line 12: Insert a comma following the words "During 2013-14,..." Introduction, line 19: Insert the verb "are" in the sentence "Its white curd is used for eating purpose while its stalk and leaves are used as fodder." Line 23: Use a plural form of the verb "enhance" instead of a singular form "enhances" in the sentence "Glucosinolates, carotenoids, indole-3-carbinol are chemicals that enhance DNA repair,..." Line 24: Insert a space between two sentences "(Sharma et al., 2004)." (the first sentence) "Cauliflower is..." (the second sentence) Materials and methods, line 47: Insert a space between a number and	Done Done Done Done Done Done Done Done Done Done Done
--	---	---



SDI Review Form 1.6

	a corresponding unit in "75 cm" Line 49: Insert a comma before and after the words "in each experimental unit" Line 53: Insert a comma after the words "In each treatment,..." Results, line 68: Insert "the" before the word "lowest", i.e., "the lowest" Line 74: Insert a comma following the words "...that during 2012-13,..." Line 76: Insert a comma following the words "On White Corona,..." Lines 78, 88: Insert a comma following the words "On Snow Mystique,..." Line 86: Insert a comma following the words "On Clima,..." Line 87: Insert a comma following the words "On Local genotype,..."	Done Done Done Done Done Done
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		