



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_24915
Title of the Manuscript:	Evaluation of common bean (<i>Phaseolus vulgaris</i> L.) varieties for resistance to bean fly (<i>Ophiomyia</i> spp.) in Kenya
Type of Article:	Original Research Article

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
Te paper is suitable for publication. In my previous review, I have suggested the authors to estimate heritability from ANOVA. In the present version, authors state that varieties were considered as fixed effects so that heritability cannot be estimated (estimation of heritability is only possible when varieties are considered as random effects). However, I vae calculated the contribution of varieties fixed effect to total variance, and it is low (0.41) for the trait the ANOVA is presented at the feedback file. Also, environments mean square is larger than varieties mean square. I suggest auhors should include a reference to this fact when discussing their results.	The varieties were considered fixed effects because the same varieties appeared in the three sides of the study while the replications were considered random effects because they varied in the three sites. The environments mean square is larger than varieties mean square (Table 2).