



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_24915
Title of the Manuscript:	Evaluation of common bean (<i>Phaseolus vulgaris</i> L.) varieties for resistance to bean fly (<i>Ophiomyia</i> spp.) in Kenya
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)																														
Compulsory REVISION comments	Authors focus their research on developing resistant varieties. In plant breeding, partitioning phenotypic variance in genetic and environmental variances is important before designing strategies tending to improve the desired trait. Being pure line available, as it appears to be the case of this experimental work, partitioning phenotypic variance is simply achieved by ANOVA test, which was indeed applied for data analysis. So, authors should estimate broad sense heritability from ANOVA tests for traits under study in this work in order to get a paper suitable for publication. Also, distribution normality of all traits should be measured before applying ANOVA tests.	<table><tr><th>Source</th><th>DF</th><th>SS</th><th>M S</th><th>F Value</th><th>Pr > F</th></tr><tr><td>ENV</td><td>2</td><td>17.24</td><td>8.62</td><td>3.96</td><td>0.0234</td></tr><tr><td>VAR</td><td>11</td><td>74.32</td><td>6.76</td><td>3.11</td><td>0.0019</td></tr><tr><td>REP</td><td>2</td><td>48.35</td><td>24.18</td><td>11.11</td><td><.0001</td></tr><tr><td>ENV*VAR</td><td>22</td><td>21.43</td><td>0.97</td><td>0.45</td><td>0.9814</td></tr></table> The ANOVA is for the pest damage on the beans. This showed high significance of bean stem maggot damage on common beans.	Source	DF	SS	M S	F Value	Pr > F	ENV	2	17.24	8.62	3.96	0.0234	VAR	11	74.32	6.76	3.11	0.0019	REP	2	48.35	24.18	11.11	<.0001	ENV*VAR	22	21.43	0.97	0.45	0.9814
Source	DF	SS	M S	F Value	Pr > F																											
ENV	2	17.24	8.62	3.96	0.0234																											
VAR	11	74.32	6.76	3.11	0.0019																											
REP	2	48.35	24.18	11.11	<.0001																											
ENV*VAR	22	21.43	0.97	0.45	0.9814																											
Minor REVISION comments	Conclusions must be less discussed.	The resistant and tolerant varieties are recommended for small holder farmers to use in their fields for farming purposes.																														
Optional/General comments																																