



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_24695
Title of the Manuscript:	Response of different walnut selection to combined application of inorganic fertilisers and organic manures.
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	1 To add walnut Latin name(in italic) 2 yield efficiency to expressed in g cm^{-2} 3 others to check in reviewed pdf file, such as in line 15,16,18,39,53,54,72,114, etc.	Done Not necessary as yield efficiency is always expressed in kg per cm^2
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	1 it's better to use yield per unit of occupation area (canopy breadth : length $\times$ width) rather than tree trunk cross sectional area 2 I think the test is a single factor complete block design. If single factor, then data from different selections (sites) do not need listing. Then table 3-5 can be replaced with one table (in the paper, the table data is redundant). If selection is considered as one factor, nutrients in different selections need to be analysed and design is with two factors. If Factorial Randomized Block Design, there will be $2 \times 3 \times 2 \times 2 = 24$ treatments(Level: NPK(2), FYM(3), vermicompost(2), poultry manure(2)). 3 Why NPK expressed in kg/ha, not in g/Kg or ppm in table 1?	We checking efficacy per tree instead of area There are two factors One selection Second fertiliser/manure Soil critical limits always provided in Kg/ha