



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</a>                                                                                                                               |
| Manuscript Number:       | <b>Ms_AJEA_23361</b>                                                                                                                                                                       |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>Effect of Stocking Density and Partitioning of Rearing Period on Growth, Feed Utilization and Production of Common Carp Cyprinus carpio L. Raised in Floating Cages in Tigris River</b> |
| Type of the Article      |                                                                                                                                                                                            |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                       |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p>The so-called <b>Research Paper</b> is unclear. The experimental work is not possible to be repeated; the topic approached is very poor. Tables are very confusing. Thus, unfortunately I reject the manuscript. It is not proper to the important <i>American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</i>.</p> <p><b>Title</b></p> <p><b>Effect of Stocking Density and Partitioning of Rearing Period on Growth, Feed Utilization and Production of Common Carp <i>Cyprinus carpio</i> L. Raised in Floating Cages in Tigris River</b></p> <p><b>ABSTRAC</b></p> <p>The effect of stocking density and partitioning of rearing period were done on growth and economic feasibility for common carp <i>Cyprinus carpio</i> L. fishes. The current study undertaken using four floating cages of wood (16 m3 in size for each cage) at Tigris river before Al-Kut Barrier, southern Bagdad, Iraq during the period from April to November 2013. Fishes weight ranged</p> | <p>All the reviewer notes have been implemented and marked in yellow when the manuscript was rewritten.</p> <p>Tables were presented right to left (as in Arabic), but now they have all rectified and presented left to right (as in English).</p> |



SDI Review Form 1.6

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|  | <p>from 63.7 to 70.9 g. The final <b>Best</b> weight of 1317.5 <b>gm</b> were recorded by fishes of treatment T1a within lowest density of 25 fish/m<sup>3</sup> at the end of two experiment parts . <b>As well as</b>, these fishes of T1a has the heights values for food conversion ratio (FCR) of 2.63, food conversion efficiency (FCE) of 0.38, survival rate 94.5%, daily weight gain of 4.99 gm/day and finely specific growth of 3.57% <b>gm</b> per day. Fish of T1a treatment was given the highest annual return of 54.80 % and rate of 1.54% among the benefits and costs competition with all other treatments. <b>????</b></p> <p><i>Key words: Stock Density, Partitioning of Rearing Period, Floating Cages, Economic Feasibility.</i><br/><b>Cyprinus carpio</b> (Not included...).</p> <p><b>1. INTRODUCTION</b><br/>Fish is considered as a rich source of protein (20%) with excellent amino acids profile including lysine and <b>metheonine</b> and high contents of calcium and phosphorus. For such nutritive value, fish resources worth protecting and developing as renewable resources (Al-Ani, 2011; Rasool, 2009). Fish farming represents the main activities to increase fish production through practicing non-conventional methods with high stocking densities (Abbas &amp; Al- Rudainy, 2008). Fish farming in cages is one</p> |  |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|



SDI Review Form 1.6

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                 |
|--|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | <p>of these intensive methods that used recently for this purpose (Pillay &amp; Kutty, 2005). Raising fish at high stocking rate in cages is considered as an economically feasible approach using neglected water bodies to increase productivity in the unit area (FAO, 2010). Recent advances in fish culture in Iraq have been developed via spreading cage culture practices among farmers and researchers. This practice attracts allow consumers to have high quality fish protein with many health advantages. The present study aimed at testing the effect of stocking density and partition of culture period with half stocking rate on growth and production of common carp raised in floating cages in Tigris River.</p> <p><b>2. MATERIALS &amp; METHODS</b></p> <p><b>2.1 Study area</b></p> <p>Floating cages were constructed (dimensions??) and located in Tigris River near Wasit Province 1 km before Kut Barragde (Fig. 1). Site selection criteria were maintained to provide acceptable conditions for cage protecting and maintain wellbeing of fish. Water current velocity ranged between 25 cm/sec. Vertical transaction of depth at the site was 8 m. The bottom was sandy clay with certain amount of gravel. Scattered aquatic plants such as <i>Ceratophyllum demersum</i> and <i>Phragmites sp</i>, <i>Vallisneria sp</i> and <i>Nymphaya sp</i></p> | <p>2 x 3 x 3 m (16 m3) Added<br/>Site selection section was rewritten with new information.</p> |
|--|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|



SDI Review Form 1.6

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|--|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | <p>were recorded in the cage location. Small-sized fish of several species (common carp, Shilig <i>Aspius vprax</i> Gerri <i>Silurus</i> sp) and freshwater shrimp are also noticed there. Continuous movement of water which was accompanied with 25-45 vprax, and s variations in water levels was affected by the passing boats.</p> <p><b>Figure 1: Iraq map contain the study area with the location of the floating cages</b></p> <p><b>Reviewer:</b> The Geographical coordinates - latitude and longitude would supply better than Figure 1? How about the climate definitions?</p> <p><b>RESULTS &amp; DISCUSSION</b><br/>The item is very limited, a mixed up of ideas, without scientific support.</p> <p><b>4. CONCLUSION</b><br/>“From the present results, fishes of T1a treatment was given the highest annual return of 54.80 % and rate of 1.54 % among the benefits and costs competition with all other treatments.”</p> <p><b>References</b><br/><b>Among 21 cited “References” are the mentioned below. Not even 1 reference 2015 was included.</b><br/>2 MSc. Dissertations; The 12th world Lake Conference; 3rd International Symposium on Cage</p> | <p>Done<br/>The study area is located between latitudes 32° 30' N and longitudes 45° 49' E</p> <p>Rectified</p> <p>Conclusion section was rectified and rewritten.</p> <p>References were enriched with more recent literature. (Nearly 15 marked reference from 2005-2015)</p> |
|--|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |  |
|-----------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|                                         | Aquaculture in Asia; Fisheries Studies Series; Final report for mini-Project MS060; Proceedings of the international workshop on pen cage culture of fish; Small projects, opportunities and challenges; Southern Regional Aquaculture Center, Publication. |  |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |  |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |  |