



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_22138
Title of the Manuscript:	Assessing the Resistance of Three Tomato Varieties to Bacterial Wilt and Stem Rot
Type of the Article	

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	Dear Editor, the argument is interesting but some improvement is necessary. The References section has to be improved/increased. The Authors have to insert the references listed below, <u>using the AJEA guidelines</u>. Page 1, line six, delete: ABSTRACT (ARIAL, BOLD, 11 FONT, LEFT ALIGNED, CAPS) 7; Page 1: Please change Place and duration of study with Place and Duration of Study Page 1, Abstract, results section: delete one full stop after "tested"; Page 1: Keywords: [Put four to eight keywords } (Arial, inclined, 10 font, justified) Page 1, line 19: delete a space after [3]; Page 1, line 20: delete a space after [4]; The references section has to be improved, the Authors have to insert the following references using the instructions for authors of AJEA. Page 1, line 15, before: In the past decades , please insert the following sentence and references: Tomato is one of the most studied plants. Studies were conducted on: the effect of packaging on the quality and storability (Islam et al., 2011); the effect of temperature on the quality and storability of Cherry tomato during commercial handling condition (Islam et al., 2012); the ripening stage (Islam et al., 2013), the ultraviolet light (UV-C) irradiation reducing postharvest fungal incidence of Cherry	We authors, agreed with the remarks made by this reviewer. Thanks for all. Line 6 was deleted In page1 all remarks were taken into consideration. Key words were reduced.



SDI Review Form 1.6

	tomato (Islam et al., 2015); volatile compounds (Alonso et al. 2009a; Alonso et al., 2009b); arsenic effect and accumulation in plants (Burló et al., 1999). Islam M.Z., Kim Y.S., Kang H.M. Effect of Breathable Film for Modified Atmosphere Packaging Material on the Quality and Storability of Tomato in Long Distance Export Condition. <i>Journal of Bio-Environment Control</i>, 20(3):221-226, (2011) Islam M.Z., Kim Y.S., Kang H.M. Effect of Temperature on the Quality and Storability of Cherry Tomato during Commercial Handling Condition. <i>Journal of Bio-Environment Control</i>, 21(2):88-94 (2012) Islam M.Z., Baek J.P., Kim Y.S., Kang H.M.Characteristics of Chilling Symptoms of Cherry Tomato Compared to Beefsteak Tomato Harvested at Different Ripening Stages. <i>Journal of pure and applied microbiology</i> 7, 703-709 (2013). Islam, M.Z., Mele M.A., Kim I.S., Hong S.K., Baek J.P., Kang H.M. Ultraviolet Light (UV-C) Irradiation Reduced Postharvest Fungal Incidence of Cherry Tomato. <i>Journal of Agricultural, Life and Environmental Sciences</i> 27(2) : 33-37 (2015). A. Alonso · L. Vázquez-Araújo · S. García-Martínez · J. J. Ruiz · Ángel A. Carbonell-Barrachina. Volatile compounds of traditional and virus-resistant breeding lines of <i>Muchamiel</i> tomatoes. <i>European Food Research Technology</i> 230, 315–323 (2009b). DOI 10.1007/s00217-009-1173-2	the recommended sentence with references was insert in the indicated place.
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	A. Alonso, R. García-Aliaga, S. García-Martínez, J.J. Ruiz, A.A. Carbonell-Barrachina. Characterization of Spanish Tomatoes using Aroma Composition and Discriminant Analysis. Food Science and Technology International 15, 47-55 (2009b). DOI: 10.1177/1082013208102385 F. Burló, I. Guijarro, A. A. Carbonell-Barrachina, D. Valero, F. Martínez-Sánchez.. Arsenic Species: Effects on and Accumulation by Tomato Plants. <i>Journal of Agricultural and Food Chememistry</i> 47, 1247-1253 (1999). Page 2, line 48: MATERIAL AND METHODS, instead of MATERIALS AND METHODS; Page 2, line 49: Material Page 2, line 50: Plant material Page 2, line 51, delete: The plant material used was mainly tomato seeds. Page 2, line 69, change: Chemical materials with Chemicals; Page 3, line 114, change 2-2-2 with 2.2.2.; Page 3, line 127, change 2-2-3 with 2.2.3.; Page 3, caption figure 1: change Figure 1 with Fig.1. , see the template of AJEA; Page 3, caption figure1, you wrote “var” as abbreviation of variety, but indicated before. Please, in the introduction section, indicate that var is the abbreviation of variety. Alternatively, the Authors can write variety instead of var, in accordance with the whole text. Page 4, line 144, change: II-2-4 with 2.2.4. Page 4, line 156, change: 2-2-5 with 2.2.5. Page 4, subsection 2.2.5.1., use the lowercase letter after colon and semi-colon; Page 5, line 164, the full stop has to be black colored; Page 6, line 220, P < 0.05, please see the template of AJEA for the correct expression and be consistent	
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	through the text; Figure 3, outdistance: “means height” is over-written on the scale values; Page 7: please, check the letters at the bottom page “ab b a”; Page 8, line 288: delete the full stop; Page 9, line 312: change Days with days; Page 11, lines 345-346, change Table I with Table 1; Page 11, line 356, change III-2 with 3.2 Page 11, line 363: change this results with this result; Page 12, line 398, only one full stop after: considered; References section: the Authors have to re-arrange each reference as required by AJEA, please see the instructions for Authors (template). For example in the reference No17 no brackets and Volume number are included; Reference No 3: why a after 2005? In general, the references section has to be re-arranged in accordance with AJEA guidelines. Figures 3-4-5-6-7-8-9-11: the letters describing the significant letters are missed; Figure 10, change Fig 10. with Fig 10. Fig.10, change: a – Symptom with a – symptom and be consistent with b and c; Figure 9: the standard deviation is missed. Table 1: in the line of Average, the standard deviation is missed.	All remarks in lines 48, 49, 50, 51, 69, 114, 127, 144, 156, 164, 312, 288, 345-346, 363, 398 were corrected. All references in References section are re-arranged In many figures the letters describing the significant are not present because there was no significant difference between varieties at any period of observation. We think that it is not useful to put the same letters in these figures. In other figures and table modifications were introduced.
Minor REVISION comments		
Optional/General comments		