



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                       |
|--------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</a>                                          |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2015_AJEA_18307                                                                                       |
| Title of the Manuscript: | EFFECT OF WATER AVAILABILITY ON THE ESTABLISHMENT, GROWTH, DEVELOPMENT AND YIELD OF OIL PALM IN GHANA |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                                             |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p><b>The study was performed from 1995-2005. Why publish the study 10 years after it was done?</b></p> <p><b>The author chose a few months to study, including May, Jul, Sept and Nov. But, what's the normal planting time in the studied area for the local farmers?</b></p> <p><b>Fig 1 only provides the rainfall information from 1995-1999 (Fig.1a) and 2000-2007 (Fig. 1b). Please describe the FULL rainfall profiles in the studies area across the entire study time: 1995-2005. Please present the rainfall data (after scaling) in the proper format, such as heatmap with row representing year and column representing months for better visualization.</b></p> <p><b>The authors claim the results of seedling establishment were significant (Line122). What is the statistical method used here to assess the significance? Similarly, the authors mentioned <math>p&lt;0.05</math> in Line 128 and Line but failed to discuss the statistical method used.</b></p> <p><b>In Fig 2 to 7, only the results after 5 years were shown. Why only show the data after 5 years? What the data from Year 1 to 5. Did the July group have the</b></p> | <p>Usually, perennial crops and oil palm in particular, the data is observed for a long time to check for any adverse effect of the methods.</p> <p>Oil palm is mostly grown in the month of June in this area. However, the farmers mostly plant on the field when the rainy seasons start.</p> <p>The area is too small to represent on heat map. In oil palm plantation, we deal with rainfall amount and water deficit values. The data presented is more useful in this format.</p> <p>ANOVA was used. LSD was used to separate the mean. It is clearly stated on the table.</p> <p>Oil palm starts yielding three years after transplanting. However, the harvesting of the palm fruits mostly take effect a year or</p> |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|-----------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                         | <p>large LA and LAI from Year 1?</p> <p>The results in this manuscript is not statistical significant. Is this because due to the sample size or what? Please give a brief discussion.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | <p>2 after fruiting.</p> <p>It does not mean that experimental results should always be significant. Therefore, the results show that the vegetative growth and yield of the oil palm are not affected by months of planting.</p> |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   | <p>Some typos in the text should be corrected. Such as missing space between two words. To list a few here:<br/>Line: 13-14: "...establishmentand high yields.In this study, twelve months oldDxP(exOPRI)oil palm seedlingswere..."</p> <p>Line 16: "...RCBDwith 4 replicates."</p> <p>Line 17: "...growth anddevelopment..."</p> <p>Please read the manuscript carefully and correct them thoroughly.</p> | <p>Have corrected the typos and the spacing that are missing.</p>                                                                                                                                                                 |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |