



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2015_AJEA_18307
Title of the Manuscript:	EFFECT OF WATER AVAILABILITY ON THE ESTABLISHMENT, GROWTH, DEVELOPMENT AND YIELD OF OIL PALM IN GHANA
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	1. All acronym names should be defined the first time they appeared in the text. 2. Appropriate word spacing should be allowed in between two words. 3. What is the meaning of "DxP (ex OPRI)?" 4. What is the meaning of FFB? 5. What is the meaning of RCBD? 6. General terms such as establishment, growth and yield should not be used in keywords selections. Oil palm growth, oil palm yield and oil palm establishment are more appropriate. 7. Diagrams to show the experimental design, oil palm tree, height measuring pole and leaf sampling position may enhance appreciation of the methodologies used in this study. 8. Line 60 to 63 should be replaced by one simple sentence. 9. In line 78-79, the following year should be 1997 instead of 1996. 10. Between the study periods 1995 to 2005, what year was the transplant performed? 11. A simple table is much preferred than the bar chart used in Figs. 1a and 1b 12. Please number all equations used in this article. 13. An equal sign is missing in the second equation. 14. Since the experiment is replicated four times, inclusion of, at least the discussion of experimental errors is necessary.	1. All the acronyms have full names now 2. the spacing and typing errors have been corrected 3. DxP means a hybrid from Dura and pisifera palms and is a common term in oil palm production and oil palm journals 4. FFB=fresh fruit bunches 5. RCBD= Randomised complete block design 6. it's not appropriate to pre-fix the oil palm in all the key words. 7. that is not necessary. Those in oil palm plantation and end-user of this work can easily picture the experimental design and well as scientists. 8. one sentence has been used to indicate the treatments. 9. correction effected 10. that has been discussed on leaf area, leaf area index, plant height as well as yield in various section of the results and discussion 11. The bar charts give a clearer picture of the rainfall amount than the table. The data was in table but it was difficult to read and compare. 12. Equations have been numbered now. 13. correction done



SDI Review Form 1.6

	15. In line 37, "Anonymous, (1980)", the comma in front of (1980) is not necessary. The same is true for line 43, "Nouy et al., (1996)". The correct form should be "Nouy et al. (1996)". 16. According to Table 1, mean establishment difference between September and November is not significant. How about the difference between September and May? 17. It is extremely difficult to relate the calendar year discussions in the text from line 127 to 136 and the horizontal axis based on years after transplanting in Figures 2 and 3. 18. The Figure Captions for Figures 4, 5 and 7 should not be part of the figures. 19. In line 175-176, it is mentioned that the number of bunches per plant is relatively high from 5 to 7 years after transplanting. However, in Table 2, November is still higher than the other months for 8 years after transplanting. Why? 20. Short forms such as t, ha, t/ha, kg should be used throughout the text. 21. In line 188-189, the two peaks mentioned occur in March and November. However, according to Figure 8, there is a dip in November. Why? 22. Quantitative rainfall data of the preceding months should be mentioned to back up the discussion in line 211-214. 23. What is the real meaning of "smoother weeds" in line 219? 24. What is the real meaning "assumes priority" in line 225? 25. The conclusion remark recommends two to three months rainfall before transplanting. How much rainfall amount is considered adequate during these months?	14. done 15. Corrections effected 16. The level of significance has been indicated and where there is significant difference, it has been stated. 17. years after planting has been used instead of the calendar year 18. The figure captions for figures 4, 5 and 7 have been detached from the figures 19. that could not be explained yet until further studies is conduct to observed the course. 20. Tonnes, shorten as ton but not t, therefore the shorts forms used in the presentation are correct. 21, that may be caused by transplanting time and have been stated in the results. 22. it has been captured in the discussion. 23. reduce weed growth 24. assumes priority means that, when any of the growth factors are limiting, oil palm uses the available resources to grow vegetatively instead of fruit production. The line that follows explained that. 25. about 150mm monthly rainfall
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	26. The conclusion remark recommends split planting. How to perform split planting? 27. Do planting seeds in July and November have the same effect as transplanting in July and November? 28. Why are palm fruits more expensive in November and December? 29. References should be arranged in alphabetical order.	26. Split planting means planting half of your seedlings in July and other in November to take advantage of high price in the November 27. the work talks about oil palm seedlings and oil palm cannot be planted with seeds on the field. It will be very difficult for me to talk about this at this stage since I haven't seen anything on the seeds yet. 28. this may be due to processing quality and demand at that time of the year. 29. References have been arranged alphabetically.
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	This is a very poorly written article with lots of typing and spacing errors. The objectives and the design of the experiment are good. However, the presentation of study results is not adequate and sometimes inappropriate. Substantial improvements on the data analysis, result interpretation and clearing up of all English syntax errors must be performed to allow better appreciation of this study.	Ok