



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2014_AJEA_13859
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of nitrogen fertilizer rates on Panicle length and Yield component of some improved rice varieties (<i>Oryza sativa</i> L.)

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
1- This study conduct only for one year (one season) and should at least repeated one year more for confirmation. 2- Although the author did not calculate the interaction between N and rice varieties but from data in different figures it seems there is significant interaction. 3- For the date it clear grain yield of all rice varieties Nerica and MWUR increased with increasing of N applications. 4- Fig 4: Under 0N (zero application) N-4 showed the same grain yield of M-3 and higher than M-4. Under 40 N applications, N-4 showed the same value of M-4. If we consider also 80 N is low fertilizer all Nerica varieties showed grain yield higher than MWUR. So what he say in the conclusion is not correct. I think this experiment should be at least repeated one year more for confirmation. Also need to re-arrange again and analyse the interaction between rice varieties and N levels .	The varieties were bred and tested in the same region and thus their performance could not be expected to change, even more based on the experience acquired. Figure 4 indicates NERICA4 had same or slightly less figures, but under 80 and 120N NERICA had slightly higher yields than MWURs. This indicate MWUR do better under low soil N than NERICAs generally, thus adapted to low input environments.