



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_21893
Title of the Manuscript:	GENETIC EFFECTS FOR MAIZE P EFFICIENCY TRAITS IN ACID AND NON-ACID SOILS OF WESTERN KENYA
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	In relation to this conclusion: The overall results of this study showed that soil acidity significantly reduced P efficiency traits in maize and affected the detection of the genetic effects for these traits. What is the practical aim of this Research? And importance for farmers? Only levels of P? Are they using maize varieties? Locally adapted? The quantities of P applied are low in accordance to soil analysis. Benefit for farmers? Acid soil affects the performance of maize and nutrients absorption and utilization. Values of Basis saturation % and CEC. Another nutrients values? Production? Productivity? Recommendations for farmers?	• The greatest happiness of any farmer is the availability of adaptable varieties/options within their context. Breeding for such adaptation in specific contexts especially under stressed environments requires understanding of inheritance and genetic control under those conditions. The knowledge generated here is expected to accelerate the development of such options (P efficient maize cultivars) for farmers. • Yes these varieties were bred for adaptation to acid soils • While in our country use of high rates of fertilizer is not common with farmers. We endeavoured to demonstrate that applying such reasonable P levels in these soils can significantly make a difference • Yes soil acidity because of high Al toxicity and P fixation greatly affect maize performance hence the need to develop acid sil tolerant varieties • Farmers are encouraged to use acid tolerant varieties, to use higher rates of P as what has been used here which is only reasonable because of sil depletion in this region
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		