



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Agricultural and Horticultural Research
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJHR_45766
Title of the Manuscript:	In vivo effect of aqueous extract of Moringa leaves on postharvest shelf life and quality of tomato fruits inoculated with fungal pathogens
New Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of aqueous extract of Moringa leaves on postharvest shelf life and quality of tomato fruits inoculated with fungal pathogens in Makurdi
Type of Article:	Original Research Article

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
<p>Due to there are still no edit of author on many issues as follow:</p> <p>Abstract:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Authors did not write their experimental design, experimental time and experimental site. - Authors should indicated that extract from moringa leaf at what concentration decrease postharvest rot and extend the longest postharvest life. <p>Materials and Methods</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Fresh leaves of moringa, what stage did authors select to pick up young leaf or mature leaf? - What temperature which moringa leaf were air dried? Authors should write more this section. - Where did authors get tomato fruits. How long did it take to transport. - After treating, authors did not write what's next, such as packaging, storage condition,etc. <p>Data collected</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Weight (g) authors should modify to percentage of weight loss in order to compare weight loss among treatments. <p>Experimental Design</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 1x5x3 factorial , authors should write a detail about their factors what meaning of 1, 5 and 3 <p>Results</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Fig 1 and Fig 2, no unit on Y-axis. Authors should fill them. <p>Discussions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Author should explain that how did extract from moringa decrease tomato's decay. Then authors add the sentence of This was due to the fact that the leaf extract possess phytochemicals such as tannins, alkaloids, flavonoids which are inhibitory to most fungi pathogens. But it's not shown what reference?. I - All Table, there is still no unit of column, for example, marketability, PD,shelf life, weight. - Since this manuscript was arranged with 	<p>Please as stated earlier, the abstract is just a summary of the entire manuscript. Abstract only contains absolutely necessary information. Please, all the information you are requesting to be included in the abstract are in the body of the work. Thanks.</p> <p>Materials and methods Leaves were picked when they were matured. As stated in the body of the manuscript, the leaves were dried at room temperature. Tomato fruits were gotten from the experimental farm. Transportation is not a requirement in this research please.</p> <p>All the necessary information are stated in the manuscript. You should not force the researcher to carry out the research by your definitions. Thanks.</p> <p>There is no need modifying weight loss. The report on weight is correct.</p> <p>Experimental design 1= one plant leaf extract, 5= five fungal pathogens. 3= three extract concentrations including control.</p> <p>Results The units are provided in the materials and methods and therefore must not be repeated on the figures.</p> <p>Please, not every statement has a reference. Authors can infer based on what they have discovered during the research.</p>



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

<p>Factorial in CRD, but all Table did not showed in the form of Factorial.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Authors should explain why did moringa's extract delat tomato fruit's weight. - Table 8, Why fruit weight of this Table are more than other Table? <p>Discussion</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - In this section, there are very little research associated with their results. Thus, authors should add related researchs in order to explain their results. Then authors add the sentence of <p>The <i>Moringa</i> leaf extract was able to form a coating on the tomato fruit which reduced the rate of respiration and therefore lowered the weight loss because an increase in respiration results in an increase in metabolic rate and higher weight loss due to the expiration of moisture . But it's not shown what reference?.</p> <p>References</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Page 24, 11. of <i>papaya</i> and change to of papaya and - Page 24, 12. (<i>Citrus reticulate Blanco</i>) change to (<i>Citrus reticulate Blanco</i>) - Page 24, 16. (<i>Citrus sinensis</i> change to (<i>Citrus sinensis</i> 	<p>The units have been provided in the materials and methods. Thanks.</p> <p>Please, your statements are full of grammatical errors and therefore difficult to interpret.</p> <p>The results on fruit weight is exactly what we got. We will not change the results because we want to satisfy a reviewer. Thanks.</p> <p>Discussion</p> <p>This area of research is new. Therefore, researches in this area are very scarce.</p> <p>Not every statement must have a reference to support it. Sometimes researchers can infer from their findings and make suggestions.</p> <p>References</p> <p>All done. Papaya is a generic name and must be written in italics.</p>
--	---