

Effect of combine application of Urea, Urease, Nitrification Inhibitors and Plant Growth Regulators on Spinach productivity

ABSTRACT: An experiment was conducted to investigate the effect of applying different rates of urea treated with nBTPT (N-(n-butyl) thiophosphoric triamide) alone, or a combination of both nBTPT and DCD (Dicyandiamide) and DMPP (3, 4-Dimethylpyrazol-phosphate), on the productivity of spinach crop at experimental area of Faculty of Agriculture, Gomal University, Dera Ismail Khan during 2012-13. The experiment under glasshouse conditions was laid out in Complete Randomized Design (CRD) with nine treatments and four replications. Composite soil samples were collected before the experiment for various physico-chemical analysis viz soil texture, soil pH, organic matter, bulk density, $\text{NH}_4\text{-N}$, $\text{NO}_3\text{-N}$, extractable P and exchangeable K. The specific results of various combinations of urea, nitrification inhibitors and plant growth regulators revealed especially treatment (T_6) with dose of Urea@150 kg/ha + GA_3 @60 gram/ha enhanced the tested parameters significantly i.e tallest plant height (11.54cm), maximum number of leaves (69), highest fresh weight (22.37g), highest dry weight (4.64g), maximum biological yield (227g pot^{-1}) and highest net return (13.42 million) may be due to availability of nitrogen for longer period and reduced loss on nitrogen by volatilization. The results suggested that applying urea treated with Gibberellic acid (GA_3) or Agrotain significantly gave profitable spinach growth. However, combine application of Urea, Urease, Nitrification Inhibitors and Plant Growth Regulators on Spinach productivity was better than urease inhibitor alone (agrotain).

Key words: Agrotain, Gibberellic acid, nBTPT, Spinach,

INTRODUCTION

Spinach (*Spinacia oleracea*) is an annual member of Chenopodiaceae family and a valuable vegetable which contains nutrients such as iron, calcium, phosphorus, sulfur, potassium etc (Peivast, 2002). Urea is the predominant form of N fertilizer worldwide and also in Pakistan (ca. 70%), principally because of its lower cost per unit of N, and the convenience for transport, storage and spreading, attributes which result from its higher N content (46% N), in comparison to the 35, 26, 21, and 18% N of ammonium nitrate (AN), calcium ammonium nitrate (CAN), ammonium sulphate (AS) and di-ammonium phosphate (DAP), respectively.

31 However, urea has been reported to have lower N response efficiency (NRE), where NRE is
32 defined as kg of additional dry matter (biomass and grain) produced per kg of applied N,
33 when compared to other ammonium- and nitrate-based fertilizers. This is especially so if urea
34 is applied under non-optimum soil moisture (very dry) and high temperature (above 20°C)
35 conditions. The lower NRE of urea has always been attributed to the wide range of N losses
36 (5% to 53% of the applied N) as ammonia (NH₃), when compared to AN, CAN, AS and DAP
37 (Saggar *et al.*, 2012). Of course, some N losses, like gaseous emissions of NH₃, nitric oxide
38 (NO), nitrous oxide (N₂O) and molecular N (N₂) and immobilization by microorganisms to
39 organic N, will be unavoidable because they are part of the natural N cycle and would occur
40 after application of any ammonium-based fertilizer or dairy farm effluents. Hence,
41 controlling the rate of all of these N losses is critical for improving the response efficiency of
42 all chemical fertilizers.

43

44 During the past decade, researchers have developed a variety of management
45 practices and technologies to improve the NRE of urea. One such approach is to treat
46 granular urea with the urease inhibitor N-(n-butyl) thiophosphoric triamide (nBTPT - trade-
47 name Agrotain®). The nBTPT is typically applied at a range of 250 to 500 mg per kg of urea
48 in order to delay urea's hydrolysis by 7 to 10 days (Zaman *et al.*, 2008). Several field and
49 glasshouse studies have shown that treating urea with nBTPT (250 to 1,000 mg nBTPT per
50 kg of urea-N) has the greatest potential to improve NRE in many cropping systems (Soares *et al.*,
51 2012). Similarly, urea can be treated with both nBTPT and nitrification inhibitors like
52 dicyandiamide (DCD) or 3, 4-dimethylpyrazol-phosphate (DMPP) have gained commercial
53 adoption in agricultural system. The soils of Pakistan are deficient in nitrogen (Shah *et al.*,
54 2012).

55

56 Similarly, fertilizer use efficiency can be further improved if urea is applied with different
57 additives like plant growth hormones or regulators (Sturm *et al.*, 1994). The word ‘hormone’
58 came from Greek language, where it means ‘to stimulate’ or ‘to set in motion’. Plant
59 hormones/growth regulators (PGR) are a group of naturally occurring organic substances,
60 which have the ability to influence physiological processes such as plant growth,
61 differentiation and development, stress responses, cell division and reproductive activities
62 when applied at a very low concentrations. Among the major classes of PGRs, auxins
63 (generally represented by indole-3-acetic acid (IAA)), the gibberellins (GAs), and the
64 cytokinins (CKs) have the most potential to be used as plant growth regulators. Curtailing
65 processes with urease or nitrification inhibitors prolong the existence of nitrogen in soil
66 giving greater opportunity to plants for its utilization and hence reducing chances of its
67 volatilization (Ali *et al.*, 2012). The soils of Pakistan are deficient in nitrogen (Shah *et al.*,
68 2012) and the farmers are using nitrogenous fertilizers, mainly urea, to remove its deficiency
69 as crops respond strongly to these fertilizers (Ehsanullah *et al.*, 2012; Ali and Noorka, 2013).

70
71 However, limited information is available on the effect of urea treated with nBTPT
72 alone versus a combination of nBTPT and DCD or DMPP, and PGRs on plant productivity in
73 hot climate conditions in Pakistan. Therefore, the objectives of this study are to investigate
74 the effect of applying different rates of urea treated with nBTPT alone, or a combination of
75 both nBTPT and DCD and DMPP, on productivity of spinach. Owing to the importance of
76 spinach, and the effect of soil mineral nutrient content on its growth, yield and quality, this
77 experiment was conducted to evaluate the effect of manure and urea on yield, nutrient uptake
78 and nitrate accumulation in spinach.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

An experimental study was undertaken to investigate the effect of applying different rates of urea treated with nBTPT alone, or a combination of both nBTPT and DCD and DMPP on productivity of spinach crop at experimental areas well as the laboratory work of N use efficiency was done in Department of Soil and Environmental Sciences, Faculty of Agriculture, Gomal University, Dera Ismail Khan. The experiment was laid out in Complete Randomized Design with following nine treatments containing four replications;

Treatments: Description

- T1: No Nitrogen or GA₃ (Control)
- T2: Urea only @150 kg N/ha
- T3: Agrotain treated Urea @10 kg/ha
- T4: Agrotain treated Urea + DCD@10 kg/ha
- T5: Agrotain treated urea @150 kg/ha + DMPP@2 kg/ha
- T6: Urea@150 kg/ha + GA₃ @60 gram/ha
- T7: Agrotain treated Urea + GA₃ @60 gram/ha
- T8: Agrotain treated urea@150 kg/ha + DCD @10 kg/ha + GA₃@60 gram/ha
- T9: Agrotain treated urea @150 kg/ha + DMPP@2 kg/ha + GA₃@60 gram/ha

Composite soil samples were collected before the experiment for various physico-chemical analysis viz soil texture, soil pH, organic matter, bulk density, NH₄-N, NO₃-N, extractable P and exchangeable K. While in plant analysis, N uptake by the plant was determined other analysis like plant height, number of leaves and biological yield were also worked out. In the diagnostic and research laboratory, the chemicals were used such as DCD (Powder) 10 kg per hectare, DMPP (Powder) 2 kg ha⁻¹, 150 kg Nitrogen ha⁻¹, GA₃ 60 gram ha⁻¹ were used. Nitrogen uptake by the spinach plant was obtained. In terms of agronomic analysis, plant

height (cm), number of leaves per plant, fresh and dry weight (g) and biological yield (g pot⁻¹). In case of economic analysis, economic yield index as net return (Rs. in million) was calculated for its commercial cultivation extensively. Data recorded for tested parameters were statistically analyzed for Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) to find out the significance of the studied parameters. Means of the studied parameters were compared by least significant difference (LSD_{0.05}) using Advanced Statistix 10 computer program (Steel *et al.*, 1997).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Plant Height (cm)

Perusal of data regarding Plant height of spinach as affected by applying different rates of urea treated with nBTPT alone, or a combination of both nBTPT and DCD and DMPP, on productivity of spinach are presented in Table I. The statistical analysis of data revealed that plant height varied significantly ($P < 0.05$) among the treatments. The shortest plant height (5.88 cm) in spinach plants recorded from control treatment (T₁) where no fertilizer was applied, whereas tallest plant height (11.54 cm) was noticed from treatment (T₆) amended with Urea@150 kg/ha + GA₃ @60 gram/ha, followed by treatments (T₅ and T₈) respectively that differed significantly from all other treatments. The value of Least Significant Difference (LSD) as 2.5, indicated significant impact of Urea@150 kg/ha + GA₃ @60 gram/ha on the plant height of spinach in agro-climatic conditions of Dera Ismail Khan. Previous study conducted by Islam *et al.* (2011) pointed out that three types of organic manure alone produced moderate plant height and they were statistically similar with each other. Previous studies conducted by Ehsanullah *et al.* (2012); Ali and Noorka (2013) that farmers are using nitrogenous fertilizers, mainly urea, to remove its deficiency as crops respond strongly to these fertilizers.

The results revealed that N uptake in the form of Urea@150 kg/ha + GA₃ @60 gram/ha enhanced the plant height of spinach in agro-climatic conditions of Dera Ismail Khan as compared to urea alone and control. This may be due to availability of N for longer period and reduced loss on N by volatilization. Similar results findings were worked out by Zaman *et al.* (2009).

Number of Leaves per Spinach

Data regarding number of leaves per spinach as affected by applying different rates of urea treated with nBTPT alone, or a combination of both nBTPT and DCD and DMPP, on productivity of spinach are presented in Table I. The statistical analysis of data revealed that number of leaves varied significantly ($P < 0.05$) among the treatments. The Minimum number of leaves (26) in spinach plants recorded from control treatment (T₁) where no fertilizer was applied, while, maximum number of leaves (69) were recorded in spinach plants treated with Urea@150 kg/ha + GA₃ @60 gram/ha followed by treatments (T₇ and T₂) respectively that differed significantly from all other treatments. The value of Least Significant Difference (LSD) as 15, showed highly significant impact of Urea@150 kg/ha + GA₃ @60 gram/ha on the number of leaves of spinach in agro-climatic conditions of Dera Ismail Khan. The similar findings of Akhtar *et al.* (2008) revealed that interaction between concentration of GA₃ and different soaking times plants treated with 10ppm for 24 hours gave maximum number of leaves per plant

Table I indicated increased N uptake (69) in the form of Urea@150 kg/ha + GA₃ @60 gram/ha in hot climatic conditions of Dera Ismail Khan, as compared to urea alone and control. Results findings of Babakhanzade *et al.* (2012) revealed that maximum manure and urea application rates considerably enhanced yield of spinach; additionally the interaction of

300 kg urea/ha × 45 ton manure/ha resulted in enhanced yield by about 54% as compared to control.

Fresh Weight (g) of Spinach

Perusal of data regarding fresh weight have made an effort to determine significant role of tested treatments by applying different rates of urea treated with nBTPT alone, or a combination of both nBTPT and DCD and DMPP on the productivity of spinach are presented in Table 1. The statistical analysis of data revealed that fresh weight varied significantly ($P<0.05$) among the treatments. The lowest fresh weight (8.52g) in spinach plants recorded from control treatment (T_1) where no fertilizer was applied, while, highest fresh weight of 22.37 g was attained in spinach plants amended with Urea@150 kg/ha + GA_3 @60 gram/ha followed by treatments (T_7 and T_5) respectively that differed significantly from all other treatments. The value of Least Significant Difference (LSD) as 4.16, indicating highly significant impact of different combinations especially rates of Urea@150 kg/ha + GA_3 @60 gram/ha on the dry weight of spinach in agro-climatic conditions of Dera Ismail Khan. Past study conducted by Wang *et al.* (2009) arrived at conclusion that any practice of maintaining a certain amount of NH_4^+-N in soil condition is greatly useful to producing an enhanced fresh weight of spinach and optimized biological yield with high quality of spinach. Similar studies by Min-na *et al.* (2012) concluded that the shoot fresh mass may be employed important index for the evaluation of NUE changes in spinach genotypes at the same N level due to high co-efficiency of variation recorded at low and high N levels in spinach production.

Dry Weight (g) of Spinach

Perusal of data recorded in Table 1 on dry weight of Spinach indicated that significant variation ($P<0.05$) existed among treatments as affected by applying different rates of urea treated with nBTPT alone, or a combination of both nBTPT and DCD and DMPP. The lowest dry weight (3.40g) in spinach plants recorded from control treatment (T_1) where no fertilizer was applied, whereas, significant highest dry weight of 4.64 g was achieved on the application of Urea@150 kg/ha + GA_3 @60 gram/ha followed by treatments (T_9 and T_5) respectively that differed significantly from each other. The value of Least Significant Difference (LSD) as 0.7, indicated low level significant impact of Urea@150 kg/ha + GA_3 @60 gram/ha on the dry weight of spinach in agro-climatic conditions of Dera Ismail Khan. The findings of Wang et al. (2009) revealed a combination of N nutrition at a ratio of 25:75 in hydroponics cultivation of spinach would optimize the fresh and dry biomass yield and quality of spinach.

As far as increased N uptake is concerned, N use efficiency of urea by nitrification inhibitors as projected at treatment (T_6) amended with application of Urea@150 kg/ha + GA_3 @60 gram/ha, enhanced the growth of dry weight in spinach plants in hot climatic conditions of Dera Ismail Khan in comparison with urea alone. Bottom line in the experimental trial of spinach conducted in study is that Urea@150 kg/ha + GA_3 @60 gram/ha considerably improved the dry weight in spinach plants over moderate rate of N or urea alone. GA_3 is proved instrumental in promoting seed germination, elongation of stem, growth of flowering and fruit in various commercial plants. These materials have crucial role in improving nitrogen management of spinach plants. Similarly findings were worked out by Margreet et al. (2008) arrived at conclusion that net nitrate uptake rate (NNUR) efficiency considerably enhanced with increasing trend of RGR. Zaman *et al.*, (2008) also suggested reduced N losses via volatilization and enhanced pasture growth with combined application of urea and GA_3 as compared to urea alone.

Biological Yield (g pot^{-1}) of Spinach

Biological yield of spinach as affected by applying different rates of urea treated with nBTPT alone, or a combination of both nBTPT and DCD and DMPP, on productivity of spinach is reflected in Table I. The statistical analysis of data revealed that biological yield varied significantly ($P < 0.05$) among the treatments. The lowest biological yield (202 g plot^{-1}) in spinach plants recorded from control treatment (T_1) where no fertilizer was applied, whereas, highest biological yield of 277 g plot^{-1} at treatment (T_6) was recorded in spinach plants amended with application of Urea@150 kg/ha + GA_3 @60 gram/ha followed by treatments (T_5 and T_3) respectively that differed significantly from all other treatments. The value of Least Significant Difference (LSD) worked out as 10.6, indicating overall significant impact of tested treatments especially highlighted dose of Urea@150 kg/ha + GA_3 @60 gram/ha on the biological yield of spinach grown in hot climatic environment of Dera Ismail Khan. Previous studies of Wang *et al.* (2009) were in association with present study which revealed a combination of N nutrition at a ratio of 25:75 in hydroponic cultivation of spinach would optimize the biomass yield and quality of spinach. Any practice of maintaining a certain amount of $\text{NH}_4\text{-N}$ in soil condition is greatly effective in producing optimized yield with high quality of spinach. Moreover, the past research conducted by Babakhanzade *et al.* (2012) pointed out highest application of manure and urea application rates resulted in increased spinach yield; furthermore, the interaction results ($300 \text{ kg urea/ha} \times 45 \text{ ton manure/ha}$) also revealed enhanced yield by about 54% in comparison with control. The use of nitrogen inhibitors seems one of the promising strategies to reduce N losses from urea on calcareous alkaline soils provided other conditions are favorable such as soil organic matter and temperature (Ali *et al.*, 2012). Zaman *et al.* (2009) also showed that agrotain and dicyandiamide (DCD) in combination were more effective in minimizing NH_3 losses and N_2O emission, and in controlling urea hydrolysis, improving pasture production and retaining N in NH_4^+ form. Other researchers also observed similar results whereas the

combined use of nitrification and urease inhibitors reported better results in terms of increasing crop yields than their use alone (Dawar *et al.*, 2010; Nasima *et al.*, 2010).

Economic Analysis of Spinach Yield

The computation of economic analysis of spinach production in Table 2 revealed that maximum Net Return (13.4 Million) was achieved by Treatment (T₆), followed by Treatments (T₅ and T₃) respectively. It has been suggested that treatment (T₆) with dose of Urea@150 kg/ha + GA₃ @60 gram/ha in terms of highest net return proved most economical and financially feasible treatments for profitable production of spinach in hot climatic conditions of Dera Ismail Khan. Economize nitrogen application indicated enhanced growth contributing factors of spinach and higher nutrient uptake, which may be attributed to its favourable effect on the environment. Additionally, such development holds a great promise to increase biological yield of spinach. These results are in accordance with the findings of Jeuffroy *et al.* (2002) who revealed that growers are faced with the task of producing crops that achieve maximum yield, while limiting production costs, in order to maximize profit, minimize the environment impact, and produce a crop of extremely high quality that is demanded by today's consumers. Similar research work undertaken by Sturm *et al.* (1994) mentioned that the cost of treating urea with the AGROTAIN® would be in the range of US\$ 66.00 to 68.00 per (metric) t of urea. The present studies were also on the analogy of Shah *et al.* (2009) worked out that Benefit Cost Ratio (BCR) either on total cost container⁻¹ bases (0.58: 1.00 and 0.76: 1.00) or on solution chemicals cost bases (1.25: 1.00 and 2.76: 1.00) were found significantly greater for Imai's recipe grown spinach crop.

250
251
252

Table 1. Plant Height (cm), Number of Leaves, Fresh Weight (g), Dry Weight (g) and Biological Yield (g pot⁻¹) of Spinach

Treatments	Plant Height (cm)	Number of Leaves per Spinach	Fresh Weight (g)	Dry Weight (g)	Biological Yield (g pot ⁻¹)
T ₁	5.88 d	25.5 d	8.52 d	3.40 c	202 d
T ₂	7.17 cd	62.75 ab	15.79 bc	4.30 ab	216 bc
T ₃	8.33 cd	53.50 bc	14.12 c	4.28 ab	223 ab
T ₄	7.79 cd	54.50 abc	14.32 c	3.90 bc	213 c
T ₅	10.99 ab	54.00 abc	17.63 bc	4.43 ab	225 abc
T ₆	11.54 a	68.75 a	22.37 a	4.64 a	227 a
T ₇	8.67 bc	65.50 ab	19.41 ab	4.29 ab	215 bc
T ₈	9.66 abc	36.25 c	16.59 bc	4.17 ab	216 bc
T ₉	9.53 abc	58.25 abc	16.57 bc	4.63 a	219 abc
LSD _{0.05}	2.5	15	4.16	0.7	10.6

253
254
255

Means followed by similar letter(s) do not differ significantly at P_{0.05}

Table 2. Economize Nitrogen Fertilizer in Spinach Production

Treatments	Value of Produce (Rs. in Million)	Cost of Production (Rs. in Million)			Net Return (Rs. in Million)
		Cost of produce	Cost of Chemicals	Total	
T ₁	12.12	0.01	-	0.01	12.11
T ₂	12.96	0.01	0.01	0.02	12.94
T ₃	13.38	0.01	0.05	0.06	13.32
T ₄	12.78	0.01	0.26	0.27	12.51
T ₅	13.50	0.01	0.08	0.09	13.41
T ₆	13.62	0.01	0.19	0.20	13.42
T ₇	12.90	0.01	0.26	0.27	12.63
T ₈	12.96	0.01	0.47	0.48	12.48
T ₉	12.14	0.01	0.26	0.27	11.87

256
257

CONCLUSION

The study arrived at conclusion that almost all tested parameters were found instrumental in improving the N use efficiency of urea by urease and nitrification inhibitors and plant growth regulators especially dose of Urea@150 kg/ha + GA₃ @60 gram/ha termed influential plant growth regulator for the sustained productivity of spinach in hot climatic conditions of Dera Ismail Khan. Findings revealed as concluding remarks that combine application of Urea, Urease, Nitrification Inhibitors and Plant Growth Regulators on Spinach productivity was better than urease inhibitor alone (agrotain).