



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Chemical Science Journal
Manuscript Number:	Ms_ACSJ_28258
Title of the Manuscript:	Thermal Properties, Crystal Structure, and Phase Transition of Racemic $\text{CaC}_4\text{H}_4\text{O}_6 \cdot 4\text{H}_2\text{O}$ Single Crystals
New Title	Same
Type of Article:	same

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The authors seem to be unwilling to accept or even acknowledge other work than their own. While our suggested decomposition pathway circumventing calcium oxalate may not be correct, the authors' refusal to cite or discuss other groups' contribution on near-identical systems (other stereoisomeric forms of calcium tartrate). The authors may - probably correctly so - argue that the paper by Vidhya et al. contains errors - which should be discussed and not ignored - and there are also others (Bull. Mater. Sci. 2004, 4, 327-331). Then the authors argue that, because of their findings, the literature TGA curves for calcium oxalate must be incorrect because they do not fit their narrative - at least that is how I understand their response to this particular subject. In my opinion, CaC_2O_4 cannot be the intermediate of their TGA experiment because it would then exhibit the same weight losses representing the same transitions at similar temperatures (nitrogen flow or not) to the literature experiments.	We wish to thank you for your comments. However, we can not accept your opinion because it is necessary to consider the CaC_2O_4 formation as the intermediate in the decomposition reaction of $\text{DL-CaC}_4\text{H}_4\text{O}_6 \cdot 4\text{H}_2\text{O}$, in order to explain the experimental results of weight loss. This paper is devoted to the study of $\text{DL-CaC}_4\text{H}_4\text{O}_6 \cdot 4\text{H}_2\text{O}$. Thus, we have only cited the most important literature in studies of L-calcium tartrate salt.