



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Chemical Science Journal
Manuscript Number:	Ms_ACSJ_26972
Title of the Manuscript:	ANALYSIS OF EDIBLE CLAY FROM ENYIGBA IN EBONYI STATE, NIGERIA, FOR ESSENTIAL NUTRIENT METALLIC ELEMENTS AND ANALYSIS OF TISSUES AND ORGANS OF RABBITS FOR THE CLAY CONSTITUENTS, FOLLOWING ORAL ADMINISTRATION OF THE CLAY
New title:	ESTIMATION OF SOME ESSENTIAL METALLIC ELEMENTS IN EDIBLE CLAY FROM ENYIGBA IN EBONYI STATE OF NIGERIA USING AAS AND EXPERIMENTS WITH RABBITS.
Type of Article:	Original Research Article

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
Key words: I think you can just add AAS and Ebonyi state-Nigeria in the Key words of original paper Page 2 last paragraph (PREPARATION OF CLAY SAMPLE FOR ANALYSIS) : spelling mistakes: and left over night What's the significance? Page12, last paragraph : The author said that the recommended dietary calcium level is 1000 mg/day for human adults ; and page 11 , first paragraph: the recommended daily allowance for Ca is 1.3 mg (WHO,2009 and 2012) . Please review the significant of a, b, and 1, 2 superscript mentioned in table values 4, 5, 6 and7; and add the superscript missed in this table values page 5,6,7,8. Page 10, first paragraph: Please review your text and the figures .5 and 7 The authors said that The half-life of elimination of Ca was higher at p<0.05 in the tissues of animals given the clay at 2000 mg/kg compared to those given the clay at 4000 mg/kg body weight, except in the lungs (Figure 5) !!!? The half-lives of K and Na in the various sampled tissues of rabbits treated with the edible clay are shown in figures 7 and 8. The half-lives of these two metals were higher in the kidney, liver, lungs, skeletal muscle at 4000 mg/kg compared to the one given at 2000 mg/kg !!? This is not what the figures shows!!!? Page 11 last paragraph : The authors said that The investigation showed that Calcium Magnesium, Potassium and Sodium in the clay has the concentrations of 249.00 ± 1.73 mg/g, 198.57 ± 0.90 mg/g, 84.33 ± 2.73 mg/g and 71.96 ± 3.63 mg/g respectively. Ogah et al, 2015; Ogah and Ikelle, 2015^a; Ogah and Ikelle 2015^b obtained similar concentrations.	Noted and effected (key words added to original paper) Noted, spelling mistake corrected and significant explained First paragraph of page 11 says 1,300 mg not 1.3 mg of Ca. However, the differences between the values stated in pages 11 and 12 have been reconciled. Noted, the significant of the supper scripts letters and numbers reviewed and missed superscripts added in the pointed tables. Noted with appreciation and have been comprehensively reviewed accordingly. Noted and the data presented as advised



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

Please you need to present the data obtained in the reference cited in the manuscript for the sake of comparison and better discussion

General comments :

Page 3, **(TISSUE KINETICS OF THE CLAY CONSTITUENT IN RABBITS):**

Carelessness and Inattention, the value of clay given to the group B of rabbits: 4000 mg/kg not 400 mg/kg.

You must use the same template MS Word, page 2 last paragraph ; page 3 paragraph 1 et 3 ; page 5 and page 6.

Page. 4, **(ELEMENTAL ANALYSES OF EDIBLE CLAY FROM ENYIGBA EBONYI STATE NIGERIA) :**

The results of the analyses of the elements present in the Edible Clay obtained are presented in table.3 not.1

Page 9 first paragraph: Unit of elimination rate constant K_{el} : ($\mu\text{g/ day}$)

The kidney had the lowest rate of Ca elimination with elimination rate constant of **9.15/day and 16.80/day** in animals treated with 2000 mg/kg and **4000 mg/kg** edible clay respectively.

Publication dates are mentioned two times in these references; Use the correct formatting please:

Abrahams, P. (2003). Human Geophagy: A Review of Its Distribution, Causes and Implications in H. Catherine W. Skinner, Anthony R. Berger, Geology and Health: Closing the gap. Oxford University Press US, 2003.

Laufer, M. (2002). Toxocariasis. Available from: URL: <http://www.emedicine.com/ped/topic2270.htm>,2002.

Michele .Z. (2011). Side Effects of High Calcium Home Diet & Nutrition, Dietary Minerals Calcium Side Effects. University of Liver Pool on Line Master Degrees Article Reviewed by Eric Lochridge Last up dated Mar. 18, 2011.

Ogah^a, S. P. I. and Ikelle, I. I. (2015). The determination of the amount of some heavy metals in edible clay of Enygba village in Abakaliki Ebonyi State, Nigeria. **Der Pharma Chemica**, v. 7, n. 11, p. 264-267, 2015.

Ogah, S. P. I., Ikelle, I. I., Ngele, S. O. and Elom, N. I. (2015) Comparative study of the brain and heart of rabbits after administration of edible clay for heavy metals. **Der Pharma Chemica**, v. 7, n. 12, p. 258-263, 2015.

Ogah^b, S. P. I. and Ikelle, I. I. (2015). The analysis of the kidney and blood of rabbits for some metals following the administration of edible clay. **Journal of Chemical and Pharmaceutical Research**, v. 7, n. 11 p. 406-410, 2015

There are two references !!?

Ozumba, U. C. and Ozumba, N. (2002). Patterns of helminth infection in the human gut at the University of Nigeria Teaching Hospital, Enugu, Nigeria. *journal of Health Science* 48:26-28. Radostits, O. M., Blood, D.C. and Gay .C.C. (1997). Veterinary Medicine. (8th ed)., W.B. Saunders Company, Philadelphia, USA. pp.66-75.

Noted and reference separated