



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Chemical Science Journal
Manuscript Number:	Ms_ACSJ_26972
Title of the Manuscript:	ANALYSIS OF EDIBLE CLAY FROM ENYIGBA IN EBONYI STATE, NIGERIA, FOR ESSENTIAL NUTRIENT METALLIC ELEMENTS AND ANALYSIS OF TISSUES AND ORGANS OF RABBITS FOR THE CLAY CONSTITUENTS, FOLLOWING ORAL ADMINISTRATION OF THE CLAY
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	Title: The title is too long and contains too many details; I would suggest you use these sentences to change it: Estimation of some essential elements in Edible Clay from Ebony –Nigeria , AAS, and experiments with Rabbits. Abstract: Please rewrite your abstract. The abstract should not be detailed 50 to 100 words in which you describe the novelty of your results (are enough), introductory remarks should be avoided. Key words: " Kg/ Body weight " is not really essential in this paper therefore, exclude this keyword. Put another keywords, I would suggest Ebony-Nigeria, AAS and half-life.	NOTED AND EFFECTED



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Introduction: You must use recent references Page.3, Results and discussions, first paragraph: The elemental concentrations cited in the text are not necessary as the data in table 1 is more than sufficient. Page 11, last paragraph: The authors said that the concentrations of these essential trace elements found in the edible clay are within the safety limits reported by WHO (1996). However, these data were not presented in the manuscript for the sake of comparison. The discussion section should be enlarged. Further, no trace element was determined in this paper in the edible clay exclude the "trace element" or substitutes it by "major". The definition of IUPAC is very clear on this. Major (greater than 1%), minor(between 0.1 per thousand and 1 percent), trace (between 0.1 per thousand and 0.1ppm), ultra trace (less than 0.1ppm). Page 12, last paragraph:	NOTED AND EFFECTED NOTED AND EFFECTED
--	---	---



SDI Review Form 1.6

	“However, with the recommended dietary calcium level of 1000mg/day for human adults, the concentration of Ca in the clay may be considered to be low when given at the doses 2000mg/kg and 4000mg/kg , this agrees with the result obtained by Michelle, (2011).” The discussion is too concise and lacks of details: data obtained by (Michelle, 2011)?. What's the significance of a, b, and 1, 2 superscript mentioned in table values? Page 6 , 7 Tables 4, 5 : Normally you need to note in your discussion, the similar concentrations of K measured in liver (114.00±10.50; 114.30±10.20) and Na measured in the Brain (110.00±28.87; 110.70±20.30 and Kidney (116.67±17.64, 116.70±24.00), in first day post treatment of rabbits with low and high concentrations of edible clay. And this Remarque should be followed by an explanation!!!? Page.5, first paragraph : Carelessness and Inattention, the values reported in the table.2 are not the same than that cited in the text !!!?	NOTED AND EFFECTED
--	--	---------------------------



SDI Review Form 1.6

	10 days after treatment with 4000 mg/kg of clay, the concentration of Ca in the brain of rabbits is 206.00 ± 115.00µg/g mentioned in the table and 186.00 ± 115 µg/g in the text. Calcium concentration obtained in the brain of rabbits (high) at day 1 post treatment: 436.00 ± 213.00 µg/g (text) instead 436.00 ± 215.00µg/g (table2). Page 8, first paragraph: Missing unit (µg/ day) of Ca elimination rate constant (Kidney). Page 7, Table 4: line 5 - column 4 : Value: 89.33±7/69? Page.3, Last paragraph, grammatical mistake: is instead are The results of the analyses of the elements present in the edible clay obtained from Enyigba Abakaliki, Ebonyi State Nigeria is presented in Table1. page.1, Key words typing error : Rabbbits instead of Rabbits References need to rewritten completely: No care has	NOTED AND EFFECTED NOTED AND EFFECTED
--	---	---



SDI Review Form 1.6

	been taken with regard to the references, no order. Publication date of the reference (Ecosse and Ngole, 2012) is missing in the listed reference Also the references mentioned in the text, such as (Brand et al 2010), (Cooper, 2000), are not listed in the references Page 2, First paragraph, mistake of the publication date: Kent and Triplett (2002) mentioned in the text, and the listed reference is: Kent A, Triplett EW (2000). Microbial Communities and their interactions in soil and rhizosphere ecosystems. Annu Rev Microbiol; 56:211-36. Please correct these references: Ozumba UC, Ozumba N. Patterns(2002) of helminth infection in the human gut at the University of Nigeria Teaching Hospital, Enugu, Nigeria. journal of Health Science 48:26-28. Peter Abrahams (2003), Human Geophagy: A Review of Its Distribution, Causes, and Implications. In H. Catherin W. Skinner, Antony R. Berger, Geology and	NOTED AND EFFECTTED
--	---	----------------------------



SDI Review Form 1.6

	health: closing the gap. Oxford University Press US, 2003. ISBN 0-19-516204-8. One reference is listed two times in the references: Peter Abrahams (2003), Human Geophagy: A Review of Its Distribution, Causes, and Implications. In H. Catherin W. Skinner, Antony R. Berger, Geology and health: closing the gap. Oxford University Press US, 2003. ISBN 0-19-516204-8. Abrahams, P. Human Geophagy: A Review of Its Distribution, Causes and Implications in H. Catherine W. Skinner, Anthony R. Berger, Geology and Health: Closing the gap. Oxford University Press US, 2003. what is ref : Laufer M, Toxocariasis. Available from: URL: http://www.emedicine.com/ped/topic2270htm,2002.?? Please write correctly the name of the author The reference mentioned in the text (Tietz et al, 1986), and details of reference: Norbert W. Titz, (1986) Textbooks of Clinical Chemistry pp965=969:1172-1187 W.B. Sanders Company Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, Inc. The Curtis Centre	NOTED AND EFFECTED
--	---	---------------------------



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Independence Square West, Philadelphia http://www.virginia.edu/bohr/mse209/chapter19.html Incidentally I could not locate the details of references, (Dixon, 1991); (USEPA, 1998); (Gibaldi and Perrier, 1982); (Michelle, 2011). General comments: a complete revision should be made to correct mistakes, including punctuation and rephrase sentences for better understanding.	NOTED AND EFFECTED
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		