



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Physical Science International Journal</a>
Manuscript Number:	2014_PSIJ_13972
Title of the Manuscript:	Controllable rogue waves in the generalized nonlinear Schrödinger equations
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b><u>Compulsory</u></b> REVISION comments	<p>I have read this article in details. In this article, rogue wave solutions with a controllable center standpoint of generalized nonlinear Schrodinger equation are obtained by using direct method. There are numerical simulations that support the analysis that is developed.</p> <p>The results presented in the paper seem correct and the technique implemented to solve the problem is generally good with some novelty. However, the following points should be considered to improve the presentation of this paper:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Probably it would have added value to the paper if some comparison of solutions with some recent papers. Such as</li> </ol> <p>[1] WANG Xiao-Chun, HE Jing-Song, LI Yi-Shen, Rogue Wave with a Controllable Center of Nonlinear Schrödinger Equation, Commun. Theor. Phys. 56 (2011) 631–637.</p>	<p>We have added some comments about the different methods used in the paper and the solutions obtained as follows:</p>



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

	<p>[2] Wei-Ping Zhong, Milivoj R. Beli´ and Tingwen Huang, Rogue wave solutions to the generalized nonlinear Schrödinger equation with variable coefficients, PHYSICAL REVIEW E 87, 065201 (2013).</p> <p>[3] M. Golam Hafez, M. A. Kauser, M. Tahmina Akter, Some New Exact Travelling Wave Solutions of the Cubic NonlinearSchrodinger Equation using the <math>(\text{Exp}(-\phi(\xi)))</math> - Expansion Method, International Journal of Scientific Engineering and Technology, Volume No.3 Issue No.7, pp : 848-851 (2014).</p> <p>You may just look at these papers and write a few comments about the different methods used in the paper and the solutions obtained.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2. The conclusion part should be added</li> <li>3. Please provide some future work in this direction at the conclusion part.</li> </ol>	<p>By a similarity transformation, rogue wave solutions to the generalized nonlinear Schrodinger equation with variable coefficients are obtained [9]. Using the <math>(\text{Exp}(-\phi(\xi)))</math> -Expansion method, some new exact traveling wave solutions of the cubic nonlinear Schrodinger equation are given [10]. The center of these solutions is located at a fixed point (0, 0) on (x, t) plane. Basing on a simple assumption, WANG and He found larger universality and applicability of rogue waves with a controllable center [11]. The above method does not consider the effect of parameters on the waveform, which is our interest.</p> <p>We have added a conclusion in our paper and provide some future work in this part as follows:</p> <p><b>Conclusion</b></p> <p>In this paper, we obtain some special rogue waves with a controllable center by a direct method and study the effects of different parameters on rogue waves. We find that the nonlinearity parameter is responsible for the width of rogue waves. In the future, we will study the effects of rogue wave solutions <math>\psi_1</math> on NLS equations by similarity transformation.</p>
<b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments		
<b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments		