



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2014_AJEA_12445
Title of the Manuscript:	Nutrients Metabolizability of Nectar for Long-Term Maintenance of Hummingbirds and Effect of a Dietary Fibre Source

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The manuscript Nutrients metabolizability of nectar for long-term maintenance of hummingbirds, submitted to American journal of experimental agriculture to be considered for eventual publication describes a new soluble diet for hummingbirds kept in captivity. I recently revised this manuscript but its quality is only poorly improved, and compared to the previous submission, it still has many faults. - The different parts of the manuscript are not balanced, Discussion is more than 1/3th of the all the pages (36). This part is verbose and contains too many quotations, which are not always necessary. Some parts are too speculative, such as lines: 297 – 309; 336-342; 354 – 360; 417 – 424. Moreover, the difference of the proposed artificial nectar in respect to others by different authors is not clear. - Materials and Methods lacks some details, as the type of pollen used to add to this artificial nectar. The pollen used for human consumption in Europe is collected by bees from Spanish <i>Cistus</i> sp. Pollen has an insoluble part so this artificial nectar is not a fluid, but a fluid plus pollen.	



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

- The manuscript contains some statements without the necessary quotations as lines: 40 after arthropods; 72 after chitin; 277 after energy; 367 after pollination. - Lines 211 and 212, if hummingbirds eat pollen and the described artificial nectar contains pollen, it means that this is another source of soluble carbohydrates. Pollen and nectar contain soluble carbohydrates, amino acids and soluble proteins, but those contained in the nectar can be absorbed immediately because of dissolved in water, whilst those of pollen are digested in other parts of the digestive tract and only after a complete rehydration. - From this manuscript it is clear that authors do know the recent knowledge of pollen and nectar biology. -	
--	--

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Anonymous
Department, University & Country	Italy