



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                                                         |
|--------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</a>                                                                                            |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2014_AJEA_14464                                                                                                                                         |
| Title of the Manuscript: | EFFECT OF COWDUNG, NPK AND THEIR COMBINATIONS ON SOIL PROPERTIES AND PERFORMANCE OF SWEET POTATO ( <i>Ipomoea batatas</i> L.) IN SUDAN SAVANNA, NIGERIA |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                                                                                               |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p>There are spacing issues all throughout the manuscript. Please take care of these carefully.</p> <p>In the introduction it seems like the crop quality was of much emphasis for sustainability and yet this paper does not really tackle food quality parameters. Clarify or revise!</p> <p>Line 20. The recommended treatment in the abstract was not exhausted in the R and D section and why it is the best (economically? sustainably? yield, availability of nutrients?)</p> <p>Line 36. replace qualitative with high quality. Replace healthy food to nutrient requirement.</p> <p>Line 52 to 55. Very long and hard to understand of a statement. Simply and shortened.</p> <p>Line 59. I suggest showing a map and delete L1 and L2 as site representations. Use site names instead all throughout the manuscript.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ What is the planting date? variety used</li> <li>➤ What are the weather conditions. Add additional weather data for these two sites especially rain, temperature, RH, PET, etc.</li> </ul> | <p>Noted</p> <p>In the introduction, the crop was summarised according to the objectives of the research.</p> <p>It was best for yield performance of sweet potato.</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Sweet potato vines was transplanted in December 2011 and harvested early May 2012. Using a local variety (Dan kano). Weather data was taken cared, as the Agro-ecological zone, Country and State was</p> |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|--|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | mentioned                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|  | <p><b>Line 78. Replace worked into incorporated</b></p> <p><b>By the way, I appreciate truly the intuitiveness of your treatment name, great job!</b></p> <p><b>Can you specify what stage of the crop was the second broadcasting done?</b></p> <p><b>Line 83. revise into: soil auger from 0 to 30 cm depth before and after</b></p> <p><b>Table 1. write H2O properly.</b></p> <p><b>Line 110. insert the word initial between the and chemical and delete "before the experiment"</b></p> <p><b>Table 3. Hard to read the column titles, delete the L1 and L2.</b></p> <p><b>Line 144 In to in.</b></p> <p><b>Line 189. Define WAT, is it DAT? still define it as Days after Transplanting.</b></p> <p><b>Line 215. Delete extra ).</b></p> <p><b>Line 222. Incomplete sentence. Total what?</b></p> <p><b>Line 245 to 251. Needs to be revised and improved. It is not well put discussion. It seems to only report the</b></p> | <p>Noted</p> <p>NPK was applied in split dose: first dose was applied at two weeks after transplanting and the remaining dose was applied at 50 days after the first application, using broadcasting method.</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Noted. (weeks after transplanting).</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>"The total" was deleted.</p> |

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                        |
|-----------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|
|                                         | <p>extreme performance of treatments. It is recommended to talk about the different combinations of mineral and organic source and discuss its outcome. Discuss it in a way where the reader will understand why they perform or not.</p> <p>Your effort in balancing organic and inorganic fertilizer source is not well put in the discussion especially that your recommendation is basically just back to plain inorganic source.</p> <p>It would be much nicer if you discuss about the potential of various fertilizer source and what is its future in terms of yield and sustainability as you put in your introduction.</p> | <p>Noted</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Noted</p> |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                        |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                        |