



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</a>                                                                                                                               |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2014_AJEA_14679                                                                                                                                                                            |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Effects of Organic Manure on the Productivity, Shelf-life, and Economic Efficiency of Tomato Varieties for Improvement of the Continuous Application of Chemical Fertilizers in Bangladesh |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                                                                                                                                  |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p><b>1. Title:</b><br/>The title is not well articulated, therefore has to be changed or re-written</p> <p><b>2. Abstract</b><br/>The design of the experiment is not well summarized</p> <p><b>3. Materials and methods</b><br/>Refer to treatment combinations and not combinations<br/>No control is mentioned<br/>Section 2.2 should not be referred to as "evaluation of the combined effects with OF's and varieties", but it's a continuation of the materials and methods</p> <p><b>4.Results</b><br/>Results that are not statistical significant should not be included<br/>Figures should be simplified, its better for the author to use simple bars<br/>Line 128—yield cannot be referred to as reproductive growth<br/>Line 130-131- rephrase<br/>Line 132- not true find another line of arguing this aspect<br/>Line 135- 136 too many grammatical errors<br/>Line 138 move to the previous page<br/>Separate results (paragraphs) and bear this in mind a</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Plant growth and number of leaves</li> <li>Yield (total),</li> <li>Soil chemical parameter</li> </ol> <p>As it is, these results are jumbled up, not well discussed, and there is a need to quote more relevant sources, that can be substantiated</p> | <p><b>1. Title:</b><br/>We have changed the Title as "Efficacy of Organic Manure on the Productivity, Shelf-life, and Economic Efficiency of Tomato Varieties in a Long-Term Fertilized Field by Chemical Fertilizers".</p> <p><b>2. Abstract:</b><br/>We have described the experimental design.</p> <p><b>3. Materials and methods:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>We have changed it to 'treatment combination'</li> <li>We have mentioned 'no fertilizer treatment' as control.</li> <li>We have omitted this sub-heading (2.2 Evaluation of the combined effects with OF's and varieties).</li> </ul> <p><b>4. Results and Discussion:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>We have excluded the results those are not statistically significant.</li> <li>Figures have been simplified and replaced with simple multiple bar graphs.</li> <li>Line 128: In our revised manuscript, We have presented yield under the heading 'yield'.</li> <li>Line 130-131: We have rephrased this part.</li> <li>Line 132: We have replaced the related references with that reference and cited accordingly.</li> </ul> |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|-----------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                         | Line 144-148 rephrase<br>Line 151-163 rephrase and separate issues<br>Line 166 move to a previous page | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Line 135- 136: We have rephrased this statement.</li> <li>Line 138: This line was moved to previous page.</li> <li>We have separated all of the paragraphs based on the described results. We have revised the 'Results and Discussion' section to avoid jumping and other errors.</li> <li>Line 144-148: We have rephrased this statement.</li> <li>Line 151-163: We have rephrased this statement.</li> <li>Line 166: We have moved this heading.</li> </ul> |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   | Grammatical errors                                                                                     | We have thoroughly check the manuscript for grammatical errors and revised accordingly.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments | The work done is scientifically sound, but it is not well presented, argued and discussed.             | Thank you very much for your cooperation. We could improve our manuscript due to your valuable comments and suggestions.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |