



## SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

### PART 1:

|                          |                                                                                |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</a>                   |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2014_AJEA_13243                                                                |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Low concentrations of humic substances enhanced the growth of Lactucasativa L. |

### PART 2:

| FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Authors' response to final evaluator's comments                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>There are important corrections to be made in the writing of the manuscript. Authors should meet all suggestions of fixes to the publication of the work:</p> <p><b>In Abstract:</b><br/><b>Methodology:</b><br/>Insert the data of humic acid concentrations evaluated: 0; 70; 500; 4,000; 6,000; 14,000 and 42,000 mg L<sup>-1</sup> or 0; 1; 7; 55; 83; 193 and 580 mg L<sup>-1</sup> (Produst HA).</p> <p><b>1. INTRODUCTION</b><br/>The information in the last paragraph of the introduction should be included in the Methodology of work.<br/>The experiments were completed under the following conditions: 1) al work was completed inva laboratory of controled environment, 2) lettuce was chosen as the tested plant due to itsvrobustnes and simplicity in analyses (on rots and leaves only), 3) the plants were grownvin solution, in which nutrients were directly aplyed to rots to maximize their uptake, 4)vtthe solution contained limited amount of nutrients, as wel as negligible organic mater andvmicrobial activites, and 5) a liquid (extracted) humic product was aplyed to the growing solution, which was manufactured to contain smal particulates (i.e. humic substances) to maximize their absorption by the rots.</p> <p>Authors should insert after the hypotheses of work goals.<br/>The experiments were completed to evaluate the efficacy of humic substances at low concentrations on the growth of letuce (Lactuca sativa L.)</p> <p><b>2. MATERIALS AND METHODS</b><br/>The description of the treatments still needs to be improved. The treatments (0; 70; 500; 4,000; 6,000; 14,000 and 42,000 mg L<sup>-1</sup> or 0; 1; 7; 55; 83; 193 and 580 mg L<sup>-1</sup> (Produst HA).)are quantitative and should be adjusted by regression analysis.<br/>Treatments: 0; 70; 500; 4,000; 6,000; 14,000 and 42,000 mg L<sup>-1</sup>. Not cite Treatment 1, 2, 3,4, 5 and 6 in the text...<br/>Correct the text....<br/>Product HA was aded to the growing solution at diferent rates from 70 (Treatment 1) to 42,00 mgL-1 (Treatment 6) providing 1 to 580 mgL-1 humic substances in the growing solution (calculated as Product HA rate x 13,80 mgL-1 , or 1.38%). Each of Treatment 1 to Treatment 6 was evaluated in one growing unit, and each treatment had 12 replications</p> <p><b>3. RESULTS&amp; DISCUSSION</b><br/>The text in the discussion of the data is incomprehensible. Authors should rewrite obeying the rules of scientific writing. Authors should consult a statistician before analyzing the data. Make adjustments regression data. Present the actual values of the treatments in the tables and figures (0; 70; 500; 4,000; 6,000; 14,000 and 42,000 mg L<sup>-1</sup>. Not cite Treatment 1, 2, 3,4, 5 and 6 in the text...)</p> | <p>-Fixed.</p> <p>-Fixed.</p> <p>-Fixed.</p> <p>-Fixed. We determined the rates based on our previous similar work in which responses were not predictable (i.e. linear or curve). As shown in Table 3, the optimum conditions were achieved between 1 and 7 mg/L, then up again because of nutrient contents in the product. We then decided to determine the rates based on asymptotic pattern, i.e. first rate = 70, second rate = 500, and so on until sixth rate = 42,000 mg/L of Product HA. If they were plotted from 70 to 42,000 in a log scale, they followed a straight line. Rounding was made to simplify the actual application of the product. This was the best effort we could to determine the rates. We did not really investigate the regression analysis as the results were not predictable.</p> <p>-Fixed.</p> <p>-Fixed. Same explanation on regression analysis as above. We still needed to mention treatments xx with the value of humic substances in the bracket.</p> |