



## SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

### PART 1:

|                          |                                                                                                                                                          |
|--------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Chemical Science Journal</a>                                                                                                        |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2014_ACSj_11703                                                                                                                                          |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>The Electron Transfer Reaction of 3,7-Bis(dimethylamino)phenazothionium Chloride with Benzenethiol in Aqueous Nitric Acid: A Mechanistic Approach</b> |
| Type of the Article      | <b>Original Research Article</b>                                                                                                                         |

### PART 2:

| FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Authors' response to final evaluator's comments                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>Revised manuscript should be corrected as following:</p> <p>Major correction:-In material and method:-Figure showing spectral scan over the range 400-700nm with maxima at 665nm should be done.</p> <p>Stoichiometric study:-Product of the reaction should be identified &amp; isolated as suggested.</p> <p>Result &amp; discussion:-1)There is no fig-1 inside the text or in the picture.</p> <p>2)Plot of <math>k_2</math> against <math>\sqrt{\mu}</math> inside the text is not fig 3, it is fig 4</p> <p>3)Fig 3 is not mentioned inside the text.</p> <p>4) In Table-5 mention Column showing the volume or % of acetone.</p> <p>5) Draw the plot of <math>1/k_1</math> against <math>1/(C_6H_5SH)</math></p> <p>6) Table 4 and 5 are not mentioned in the text.</p> <p>7) ..... should be omitted in numbering the equations. Instead equations should be numbered in square bracket like [1].</p> <p>8) Calculate the activation parameter to know the trend of the reaction.</p> | <p>The Figure of the spectrum of <math>MB^+</math> has been provided as Fig. 2.</p> <p>Stoichiometric study as suggested, has been corrected (refer to equation 1) .</p> <p>1)- It is not true that Fig. 1 was not cited in the text (refer to line 2 under Introduction).</p> <p>2&amp;3)-The citation and numbering of all Tables and Figures in the text have been made.</p> <p>4)- Table 5 has been modified as suggested.</p> <p>5)- Plot of <math>1/k_1</math> against <math>1/(C_6H_5SH)</math> has been drawn and labelled as Fig. 8.</p> <p>6)- All Tables have been cited in the text.</p> <p>7)- All equations have been presented as suggested.</p> <p>8)- The reaction rates were investigated at <math>29^\circ C</math> and not at different temperatures (as presented in the text). Therefore, calculation of activation parameter as suggested by this reviewer would not be possible. Tables 1- 4 have shown the reaction trend.</p> |